

## VU Research Portal

-- [Review of: Michael Southon (1996) The Naval of the Perahu; Meaning and Values in the Maritime Trading Economy of a Butonese Village]

Schoorl, J.W.

***published in***

Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde  
1996

***document version***

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

***citation for published version (APA)***

Schoorl, J. W. (1996). -- [Review of: Michael Southon (1996) The Naval of the Perahu; Meaning and Values in the Maritime Trading Economy of a Butonese Village]. *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde*, 152 (2), 326-327.

**General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

**Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

**E-mail address:**

[vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl](mailto:vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl)



## Book Reviews

- R. Anderson Sutton, Wim van Zanten, *Ethnomusicology in the Netherlands: present situation and traces of the past*. Leiden: Centre of Non-Western Studies, Leiden University, 1995, ix + 330 pp. [Oideion; The performing arts worldwide 2. Special Issue]., Marjolijn van Roon (eds.)
- T.E. Behrend, Willem Remmelink, *The Chinese War and the collapse of the Javanese state, 1725-1743*. Leiden: KITLV Press, 1994, 297 pp. [Verhandelingen 162].
- Erik Brandt, Eric Venbrux, *A death in the Tiwi Islands; Conflict, ritual and social life in an Australian Aboriginal Community*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995, xvii + 269 pp.
- Madelon Djajadiningrat-Nieuwenhuis, Tineke Hellwig, *In the shadow of change; Images of women in Indonesian literature*. Berkeley: University of California, Centers for South and Southeast Asia Studies, 1994, xiii + 259 pp. [Monograph 35].
- M. Estellie Smith, Peter J.M. Nas, *Issues in urban development; Case studies from Indonesia*. Leiden: Research School CNWS, 1995, 293 pp. [CNWS Publications 33].
- Uta Gärtner, Jan Becka, *Historical dictionary of Myanmar*. Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Press, xxii + 328 pp. [Asian Historical Dictionaries 15].
- Beatriz van der Goes, H. Slaats, Wilhelm Middendorp over de Karo Batak, 1914-1919. Deel 1. Nijmegen: Katholieke Universiteit, Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid, 1994, xvii + 313 pp. [Reeks Recht en Samenleving 11]., K. Portier (eds.)
- Stephen C. Headley, Janet Carsten, *About the house, Lévi-Strauss and beyond*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995, xiv + 300 pp., Stephen Hugh-Jones (eds.)
- Stephen C. Headley, James J. Fox, *Inside Austronesian houses; Perspectives on domestic designs for living*. Canberra: Department of Anthropology, Research School of Pacific Studies, The Australian National University, 1993, x + 237 pp.
- M. Hekker, Helmut Buchholt, *Continuity, change and aspirations; Social and cultural life in Minahasa, Indonesia*. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 1994, vii + 231 pp., Ulrich Mai (eds.)
- Tineke Hellwig, Brigitte Müller, *Op de wipstoel; De niet-gewettigde inheemse vrouw van de blanke Europeaan in Nederlands-Indië (1890-1940); Een literatuuronderzoek naar beeldvorming en werkelijkheid*. Amsterdam: Vakgroep Culturele Antropologie/Sociologie der Niets-Westerse Samenlevingen, 1995, xii + 131 pp.
- Jan van der Putten, Liaw Yock Fang, *Standard Malay made simple*. Singapore: Times Books International, 1988.
- Jan van der Putten, Liaw Yock Fang, *Standard Indonesian made simple, written with the assistance of Nini Tiley-Notodisuryo*. Singapore: Times Books International, 1990.
- Jan van der Putten, Liaw Yock Fang, *Speak standard Malay; A beginners guide*. Singapore:

Times Books International, 1993, xxii + 280 pp.

- Jan van der Putten, Liaw Yock Fang, *Speak Indonesian; A beginners guide*, written in collaboration with Munadi Padmadiwiria and Abdullah Hassan. Singapore: Times Books International, 1990.

- Alle G. Hoekema, Chr.G.F. de Jong, *Geschiedenis van de Nederlandse Zending op Zuid-Sulawesi 1852-1966; Een bronnenpublicatie*. Oegstgeest: Raad voor de Zending der Nederlands Hervormde Kerk, 1995, xi + 524 pp.

- George Hotze, Ronald G. Gill, *De Indische stad op Java en Madura; Een morfologische studie van haar ontwikkeling*. Delft: Publikatieburo Bouwkunde, Technische Universiteit Delft, 1995, 350 pp.

- H.A.J. Klooster, Holk H. Dengel, *Neuere Darstellung der Geschichte Indonesiens in Bahasa Inonesia; Entwicklung und Tendenzen der indonesischen Historiographie*. Stuttgart: Steiner, 1994, vii + 269 pp.

- Harry A. Poeze, Hans Antlöv, *Imperial policy and Southeast Asian nationalism 1930-1957*. Richmond: Curzon Press, 1995, xiii + 323 pp., Stein Tonnesson (eds.)

- P.W. Preston, Michael Hill, *The politics of nation building and citizenship in Singapore*. London: Routledge, 1995, x + 285 pp., Lian Kwen Fee (eds.)

- J.W. (Pim) Schoorl, Michael Southon, *The navel of the perahu; Meaning and values in the maritime trading economy of a Butonese village*. Canberra: Department of Anthropology, Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies, The Australian National University, 1995, xiv + 150 pp.

- Henk Schulte Nordholt, Geoffrey Robinson, *The dark side of paradise; Political violence in Bali*. Ithaca/London: Cornell University Press, 1995, xxii + 341 pp.

- Herman A.O. de Tollenaere, Th. Stevens, *Vrijmetselarij en samenleving in Nederlands-Indië en Indonesië 1764-1962*. Hilversum: Verloren, 1994, 400 pp.

- Donald E. Weatherbee, Mpu Prapañca, *Desawarnana (Nagarakrtagama) by Mpu Prapañca*, translated and edited by Stuart Robson. Leiden: KITLV Press, 1995, viii + 158 pp. [Verhandelingen 169].

- E.P. Wieringa, Jennifer Lindsay, *Kraton Yogyakarta*. Diterjemahkan oleh R.M. Soetanto dan T.E. Behrend. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia, 1994, xvi + 330 pp. [Seri katalog Induk Naskah-Naskah Nusantara 2], R.M. Soetanto, Alan Feinstein (eds.)

- E.P. Wieringa, Wouter Smit, *De islam binnen de horizon; Een missiologische studie over de benadering van de islam door vier Nederlandse zendingscorporaties (1797-1951)*. Zoetermeer: Boekencentrum, 1995, xix + 312 pp. [MISSION 11].

In: *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 152 (1996), no: 2, Leiden, 293-338



## Book Reviews

Wim van Zanten and Marjolijn van Roon (eds), *Ethnomusicology in the Netherlands: present situation and traces of the past*. Leiden: Centre of Non-Western Studies, Leiden University, 1995, ix + 330 pp. [Oideion; The performing arts worldwide 2. Special Issue]. ISBN 90.73782.44.9. Price: f 45.-.

R. ANDERSON SUTTON

This volume, the second in the *Oideion* series, offers a picture of Dutch ethnomusicology through accounts of the major figures (Kunst and Bake, among others) and through examples of recent scholarship. The articles are grouped in three sections: six on Dutch ethnomusicology and related activities; five on Indonesian music and performance traditions; and five on music in other Asian cultures. Although apparently conceived as a 'journal,' this issue has appeared a full two years after the previous number and in many respects more closely resembles an edited volume. Nevertheless, the articles are essentially independent of one another and, after the first section, are not united by focus on any particular theme or issue. For the most part, they are well written and have much to offer, presenting new data and often addressing issues of concern to ethnomusicologists.

The editor's preface summarizes the contents and arguments of each contribution quite efficiently (pp. vii-ix). Here I have room only to offer a few comments on each. The opening essay on the 'pioneer' ethnomusicologists by Van Roon provides an informative overview of several important figures (Van Gulik, Bake, Brandts Buys, Kunst, and others in Dutch colonies), but does not even acknowledge, let alone debate, the problematics of colonial scholarship and 'orientalism' (e.g., as outlined by Edward Said). In the second article, Van Zanten describes trends from 1960 to 1995, albeit with what I find a troubling equation of 'ethnomusicology' with a study of 'non-Western music' (and performing arts). Many scholars have argued for some decades now that ethnomusicology be defined by its approach to music (*any* music) and not by the place or culture of origin of that music; and, indeed, numerous ethnomusicological studies of the last fifteen years interpret Western art music through the cultural hermeneutics we now readily identify as 'ethnomusicological.'

The next three articles are more specific in their topic and offer largely uncontroversial descriptions. The first discusses the place of world music (again, 'non-Western' music) in music education in the Netherlands, where

government support for such activity appears to be relatively high compared, for example, to the United States. This is followed by Van Roon's detailed and well-documented account of Kunst's years as Government Musicologist in the Netherlands East Indies and Kouwenhoven's brief description of Dutch folk music scholar and enthusiast Ate Doornbosch and his influential and long-running radio show 'Onder de Groene Linde'. The last article in this first section concerns neither Dutch ethnomusicology nor non-Western music, but rather music inspired by non-Western music (gamelan, primarily) and written by the well-known Dutch composer Ton de Leeuw. It outlines De Leeuw's concept of 'extended modality' and its contrasts with traditional concepts of modality in other (mostly Asian) cultures.

The section on Indonesian performing arts begins with Barendregt's informative account of Minangkabau martial arts (*silat*) in West Sumatra. He demonstrates with field data the important relationship between *silat* practice and the Sufist Islam and traditional law that continue to define Minangkabau cultural life today. Another contribution on a little-studied region is Bos's article on the *foi meze* bamboo flutes of Rowa, Flores. The article suffers from a preservationist and at times naive and even patronizing tone. For example, the author states, 'Besides all these "foreign" authorities on Florenese music, the Florenese themselves are very knowledgeable about their traditional music. Nevertheless, none of their efforts have yet resulted in publications, as far as I know.' (p. 133.) Of course, Florenese know about their own music; and why should one expect publications among people who have traditionally preserved knowledge in other, oral forms? I am also troubled by statements such as 'The following sections deal with the music of *foi meze* as it *should* be performed' (p. 135). According to whom? In contrast, Vonck's article on *gendèr wayang* music in Tejakula, North Bali is a well-documented account of music in context, and one that provides an important perspective in counterbalance to the many studies of this and other musics of South Bali.

Scholars have been debating the principles of Indonesian tunings and scales for over 100 years. While I would disagree with Gomperts when he states that 'a clear, unambiguous notion of scales and tuning systems [...] is one of the essential objectives of ethnomusicology' (p. 178), his article offers one of the best statistical studies of tuning and does so for Sunda, Java, and Bali. The kind of positivist research he undertakes, relying on physical measurements with only occasional reference to indigenous conception, is clearly not the direction that ethnomusicology seems to be taking, nor should it be. (Without knowledge of advanced physics, parts of this article are simply impenetrable.) In the next article, Van Zanten offers rich historical data on Sundanese (and Javanese) notation, going beyond objective accounting to offer both a critique of Kusumadinata's highly problematic notation and to suggest alternatives, including systems he and other Dutch musicians have devised for *kacapi* (zither) and singing, which

are proving useful not only to Dutch, but to some Sundanese musicians also.

The last section contains a diversity of articles – covering continuity of compositional techniques in Karnatic music (Te Nijenhuis), the problematics of transnotation in Japanese court music (Wolpert), a field study of women partaking of men's singing tradition in Jiangsu Province, China (Schimmelpenninck and Kouwenhoven), results of an interview with Ms. Dai Xiolian, *guqin* (fretless zither) player, and a field study of Tuvan throat singing (Van Tongeren). With the exception of the interview (written up by Van Roon), each of these addresses a specific musicological question or issue and demonstrates proper familiarity with the culture. The interview relies entirely on linguistic interpreters and, while an interesting read, might better serve as the first step in a research project.

In sum, *Oideion 2* is an informative contribution to knowledge, with many articles of high quality. I would ask the editors to rethink the choice of a 'non-Western' focus as the defining element in the discipline of ethnomusicology, as many of the field's best scholars have been working against this and other remnants of a binary division of the world based on the colonial past.

---

Willem Remmelink, *The Chinese War and the collapse of the Javanese state, 1725–1743*. Leiden: KITLV Press, 1994, 297 pp. [Verhandelingen 162]. ISBN 90.6718.067.X. Price: f 50.–.

T.E. BEHREND

Perhaps it is the tiny number of scholars working on Javanese history that has given rise to a convenient sort of specialist territorialism among the leading scholars in the field. Of the Big Three productive senior historians, Ricklefs does court-oriented history of Kartasura and early Yogyakarta, Carey concentrates on the first quarter of the nineteenth century in Yogyakarta, while Kumar ranges more widely over a period of two centuries, less interested in the courts *per se* than in large personalities and, more recently, the neglected area of material culture. Most scholars moving on to the scene in recent years seem to have gravitated towards the gaps and lacunae in this coverage, or to have taken up new, more theoretical concerns, and there has been little overlapping of historical specializations.

Given this habit of *de facto* territorialism, it is a welcome development that several younger scholars have recently joined Ricklefs in the intensive study of the troubled times and violent history of the Central Javanese state during the 65 years that its capital was located at Kartasura (1680–1745). L.W. Nagtegaal's 1988 dissertation at Utrecht (*Rijden op een Hollandse tijger; De noordkust van Java en de VOC 1680–1743*) was the first

major contribution in this area. It is followed now by the work under review.

Rummelink's book breaks down into three sections which the author refers to as the panels of a triptych in his interestingly personalized prefatory comments on theoretical issues. The first section of the body of the work is a general introduction that orients the reader to the political and social dynamics of the Kartasura era, at the same time painting an especially cogent picture of the Javanese state in this era, and of the institution of kingship at its core. In the process Rummelink reviews the main works of historical and sociological scholarship on the subject, including a modest assessment of the place of his own work. This section taken alone is an exceptionally lucid formulation on the nature of Javanese statecraft, and should be recommended beside Schrieke, Moertono, and Anderson for students of Javanese culture and history.

The main part of the work is a four-chapter section comprising an extremely detailed, sometimes day-by-day, chronology of the intrigues and activities of the Javanese court between 1725-1743. Particular attention is paid to the Chinese War in the last years of that period. At times the close detail makes for tedious reading in which historical and social processes are largely overwhelmed by the daunting catalogue of individual names and dates that is augmented with every paragraph read. While eighteenth-century specialists may revel in this, most readers will have a tough time keeping track of the more than 500 personal names (mostly in 4 or 5 syllables) that appear in the 170 or so pages of this chronicle.

Amidst this congeries of facts and details there is much of interest, of course, and some valuable contributions. One central element of Javanese political life that is hardly illuminated elsewhere but that Rummelink brings clearly into focus is the existence of complex networks of allies and relations among the major regional authorities, and their decisive role in determining the course of political developments. The treatment of treaty negotiations, particularly with regard to the interests of the Javanese side is also especially good.

In this historical summary Rummelink has depended almost entirely on VOC sources. The decision to use this inherently limited approach, and thereby to create a rather flat account of the central events of these years, was conditioned by Rummelink's principal interest in undertaking the study. It is not just the historical facts that he is trying to work out. Instead, he is much more interested in investigating the nature of the Javanese *babad*, the fundamentally literary genre of Javanese poetry that deals with historical facts and personalities.

In the final and most valuable chapter of the book Rummelink joins Brandes, Djajadiningrat, Berg, De Graaf, Ricklefs, Kumar, Worsley, Day, Carey, Ras, and (most recently and creatively) Florida in the babadological discourse – far and away the most highly articulated scholarly dialogue in the area of Javanese literary studies. His contribution is to use the detailed



chronology of the middle section to test the historical reliability of *babad* historiography. He does this by lining up the VOC facts (carefully interpreted, and with full realization of their shortcomings) beside those presented in the *babad* narrative. The significant variations between the two then become keys to understanding the literary, political, and cultural dimensions of the selected *babad* text. The resulting portrait of the genre has taken the issue of referentiality in babadological studies to a new height, and makes this book required reading for all students of Javanese literature and history.

The book is not without its flaws. Among the less consequential are the lack of tools to help keep track of the complicated details of the historical chronicle: better maps (that between pp. 172-3 is almost illegible), genealogical charts, a full index containing place names and keywords in addition to the index of proper names would all have made the history part of the book easier to follow and understand. A more niggling criticism – and one I make in the context of deep respect and admiration for the level of English mastery of my Dutch colleague – has to do with language. In this case it is the KITLV rather than the author who must be blamed for a poor editing job that has left the English of Rummelink's text peppered with small errors of style, diction, grammar, and syntax.

Other shortcomings are much more grave and need to be kept in mind by all readers. Most of these arise from the author's admittedly limited mastery of the Javanese literary and cultural traditions, and from his historian's lack of concern for philological issues. In this latter area Rummelink has been misled by a too trusting acceptance of Ras's writings on the textual history of the *Babad Tanah Jawi*. (This is not the proper place to discuss Professor Ras's contribution to the study of *babad* literature, but it should be noted that his ideas rely quite heavily on interpretations of narrative and content carried out in the absence of an adequate foundational investigation of the literary corpora with which he is working.) As a result, Rummelink falls into the trap of simply dismissing or otherwise ignoring tens of thousands of pages of manuscript sources on Kartasura in the libraries of Jakarta, Yogyakarta, Surakarta, Leiden, Denver(!) and elsewhere. Instead he settles on a late copy of a late recension of the compound *Babad Tanah Jawi* as the basis for his studies. This weak philological footing necessarily calls into question the specific instances of variation in content that Rummelink points out in his text, though it has no effect at all on the general validity of his method, or the notional value of his conclusions.

The second serious flaw in Rummelink's book is the fact that he is attempting to understand the dynamics of a given literary genre without adequate familiarity with other literary genres and the Javanese literary tradition as a whole. The author ignores the rich intertextuality of Javanese literature in his analysis, and in the end is forced to seek models for textual processes in the extraneous oral tradition of *wayang purwa*. While there is

demonstrably a good deal of aesthetic exchange and influence between court literature and shadow-puppet theater, the process occurs at a higher level than *lakon* X and *babad* Y. Characterization in Rummelink's mid-nineteenth-century *Babad Tanah Jawi* depends much more directly on the norms of characterization in the literature of Pakubuwana VII's court than on the 'timeless' standards of *wayang* performance. We cannot, however, blame Rummelink or any other social science scholar of Java for ignoring the literary stylistics of PB VII's *kraton*, since the philologists and literary historians have so far failed to make any contributions in this area. The methodological shortcomings must nevertheless be pointed out.

In conclusion, Rummelink's study of the late Kartasura period based on comparative readings of VOC and Javanese courtly records represents a valuable interim contribution to the general discourse on the nature of the *babad*, with particular regard to the ways in which it adapts and literizes contemporaneous historical events. For the larger literary questions, though, that conceive *babad* in broader cultural and critical contexts, the work of Day and Florida is much more compelling and suggestive. This work may also prove to be of evanescent value for its historical content, as the second volume of Ricklefs massive study of Kartasura is due out some time in 1997, and early signs seem to indicate a more nuanced and thorough treatment than Rummelink has achieved here.

---

Eric Venbrux, *A death in the Tiwi Islands; Conflict, ritual and social life in an Australian Aboriginal community*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995, xvii + 269 pp. ISBN 0.521.47351.9 (hardback); 0.521.47913.4 (paperback). Price: £ 35 (US\$ 49.50) (hb).

ERIK BRANDT

Tobias Arapi was born around 1927 in Malau on the Melville and Bathurst Islands north of the Australian coast. In the morning of 29 October 1988 his body was found under the mango tree in front of his hut. He had been killed. Two months before, the Dutch anthropologist Eric Venbrux had arrived on the islands, intending to do his PhD on the mortuary practices of the Tiwi people. As both men had been working together in the weeks preceding Tobias' death, Venbrux decided to focus on the dramatic death of this man and the events that were to follow, adding the complex problem of violence to his original theme. Venbrux shows himself a gifted ethnographer, who has done far more than gather a wealth of material. He has also managed to process this into a rich and well-written monograph, which offers a dignified portrait of the people among whom he worked.

Venbrux approaches the homicide case as a 'diagnostic event' that

enables him to gain insight into late-twentieth-century Tiwi society. In the months preceding his death Tobias had become involved in a series of disputes. As with most Tiwi conflicts these disputes concerned women, which offers Venbrux the opportunity to discuss traditional Tiwi marriage politics and their transformations under the influence of the Roman Catholic mission. A detailed description of Tobias' burial and post-funeral rituals leads to an analysis of the symbolic creativity through which Tiwi come to terms with death and grasp the meaning of life. Representations of violence come into view as important elements in these as well as other Tiwi rituals. Tobias' death was locally understood as punishment, and thus Venbrux discusses Tiwi 'law'. But, of course, this homicide was also within the purview of the criminal justice system of the Australian state, which gives rise to a fascinating chapter on cross-cultural miscommunication and its grim consequences for Aboriginal suspects.

For a long time the idea of correcting popular prejudice that primitive peoples are brutal savages has induced anthropologists either to turn a blind eye to violence, or to dissociate it from local culture. As a consequence, homicide in Aboriginal societies has been either ignored or described in terms of social disintegration brought about by the forces of colonialism. Aboriginal agency, levels of violence in precolonial societies, and the meanings killing might have to those involved are denied. This tradition has proved untenable, and Venbrux has good reason to dissociate himself from it. With this book he offers a valuable ethnography, which convincingly demonstrates the relevance of transforming indigenous culture to the generation and interpretation of violence in contemporary Aboriginal society.

---

Tineke Hellwig, *In the shadow of change; Images of women in Indonesian literature*. Berkeley: University of California, Centers for South and Southeast Asia Studies, 1994, xiii + 259 pp. [Monograph 35]. ISBN 0.944613. 21.7. Price: \$ 22.-.

MADELON DJAJADININGRAT-NIEUWENHUIS

This monograph is based on the author's PhD dissertation (Leiden University 1982), *Kodrat Wanita*: the female disposition or destiny. A woman cannot escape her destiny as a carer, whereby she sacrifices her own needs to those of others.

In *In the Shadow of Change* Hellwig discusses twenty-five novellas and three stories, published between 1937 and 1986, her purpose being to look at how female characters in this period have been portrayed, in order to distil the general image of the woman in Indonesian society. By discussing

the literature chronologically, Hellwig hopes to point out changes in the position of women and in gender relations. The author's assumption is that Indonesian women have not actively taken part in bringing about the changes in Indonesian society in the period mentioned. For this reason she places the Indonesian woman in the 'shadow', thereby referring to the role of the shadow in the *wayang*.

Her decision to begin her story in 1937 (with Hamka's *Merantau ke Deli*) is based mainly on the fact that the study of Els Postel-Coster (*Het Omheinde Kweekbed*, Delft, 1985) deals with the period 1920-40.

In her analysis of the texts, Hellwig's starting-point is a normative feminist approach. Literature should not be isolated from the culture of which it is a part. In this, Hellwig associates herself with 'soft' deconstruction (K.K. Ruthves 1984) – that is 'decentering masculine constructions of reality'. From this perspective she devotes herself to '(re)reading and (re)evaluating the texts in search of the images of women'. In the five chapters in which she discusses her choice of literature, Hellwig analyses the image-making surrounding gender relations and the opportunities for power open to women. In Chapter 7 she turns to female authors and their functioning in a male-dominated environment. It appears that male authors tend more to portray women as strong figures. The explanation could be that female authors tend to emphasize the prevailing ideology out of fear of not being taken seriously. Another explanation is that the male authors are older and still have a Netherlands East Indies (colonial) past with Western values and norms, or that women have internalized the male norms. These are two psychological explanations and one socio-historical, which are not given any more far-reaching clarification.

In her last chapter Hellwig looks at the ideologies of Indonesian society in order to 'link Indonesian fiction to the real world of its writers and readers', in which both religion and worship play an important role. Javanese culture and Islam are the most important determining factors with regard to gender relations: polygamy for men, but virginity and faithfulness to the husband for women. '*Ibuism*' and the '*kodrat wanita*' in the modern state ideology determine gender and power relations. In the literature discussed by Hellwig the female figures adapt to this prevailing culture.

Finally, Hellwig concludes that in the past fifty years literature has gained a number of themes, such as divorce, rape, artificial insemination, and homosexuality, but that the image of women as the second sex has not changed. She points to the fact that feminism in Indonesia is a political stance which could threaten patriarchal power relations. The literary world in Indonesia – writers, readers, and critics – adheres to the rules of the game, as laid down by the state.

Hellwig's study paints an interesting picture of literary convention in Indonesian literature in respect of the position of women. However, the question is to what extent this convention is a reflection of the reality. That this convention is a reaction in a period in which traditional values and

norms were threatened by war, revolution, and modernization is also a possibility, as Nancy Florida has pointed out (also from a feminist perspective) in her paper, 'Sex Wars; Writing Gender Relations in Nineteenth-Century Java'. 'To link fiction to the real world' may also result in the position of men becoming so threatened in a changing society that a mirror is held up to the woman to show her how she should conduct herself in order to avert the evil.

Finally, a few other critical remarks are needed. The period chosen, in my view, should have a broader base than merely coinciding with an earlier published work. Hellwig's approach lacks historical argument. This is all the more deplorable, since the purpose of the study is to research the possibility of change using a chronological approach.

From Hellwig's feminist perspective, culture is somewhat simplified in some cases – by, for example, the remark that Indonesian women have not played an active role in the changes in society, or that Indonesian literature is based on patriarchal norms. Indonesian history and gender relations in different cultures are too complex to be characterized in such an unambiguous way.

---

Peter J.M. Nas (ed.), *Issues in urban development; Case studies from Indonesia*. Leiden: Research School CNWS, 1995, 293 pp. [CNWS Publications 33]. ISBN 90.73782.38.4. Price: f 35.–.

M. ESTELLIE SMITH

This volume is a follow-up to a previous volume edited by Nas on *The Indonesian Town; Studies in Urban Development and Planning* (1986) and, as the editor notes in his 'Introduction' (p. 1), 'can be considered the third in a "series" of books on Indonesian urban society – the first being *The Indonesian City; Studies in Urban Sociology* (1958). The papers in this volume were first presented at a workshop on 'The Indonesian City Revisited' and focus on such matters as 'urban ecology, architectural heritage, urban cultural institutions, [...] infrastructure development [...] and changes in planning concepts for Jakarta' (pp. 1-2), particularly as these are determined by the activities of local governments, public-private partnerships, and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). An especially useful feature is the addition of an bibliography of work on 'Indonesian cities, 1985-1995' (pp. 246-293), which updates (as well as adds some items not appearing in) a comprehensive bibliography prepared by O.D. van den Muijzenberg and P.J.M. Nas in 1986.

The thirteen papers in the volume are all of exceptional quality and offer a wide-ranging perspective of Indonesian life as it takes place in or is affected by urban places. Unlike many urban volumes, all of the papers

demonstrate that the writers have a strong sense of historical factors and, as well, are keenly aware of the dynamic interrelationship between cities and their hinterlands or regions. Luc Nagtegaal's paper (pp. 9-30), for example, discusses 'Urban pollution in Java, 1600-1850' and, in addition to taking the long historical view, draws striking comparisons between Javanese and European urban centres of the same period, contrasting microbial pollution (the results of dirty water, piles of garbage, and primitive sewage facilities), artisanal pollution (waste from breweries, tanneries, and slaughterhouses), and industrial pollution. The picture drawn is compelling for, as Nagtegaal's final sentences tell us, 'The tragedy of the Indonesian cities is that they have been caught up by modern industrial pollution before they have learned to cope with the "old" pollution. Now they have both mercury *and* shit in their water [...] the worst of both worlds' (p. 28).

In his paper on 'The plague year', Freek Colombijn builds on Galjart's thesis that there are always several interest groups in the creation of pollution, to argue that such groups have both incentive and opportunity to shift the polluting consequences of their behaviour off onto others. He concludes, however, that despite Indonesia's plural character, 'the real dividing line during a period when beetles infested Padang's copra stocks, was between leaders of the trade firms and the have-nots. In the case of plural societies such as Indonesia, "passing the buck" produces diverse and complex views as to the origin, identity, and locus of – as well as, importantly, responses to – the urban pollution that provided a friendly environment for the infestation.'

Tracing the shifting urban character – architecture, lay-out, and use of space – in Medan, Indonesia's fourth largest city through text and well-chosen illustrations, Cor Passchier concludes that, in general, 'the lack of a coherent vision on urban and architectural heritage or city management seems to be a main problem for the Indonesian city' (p. 63). His text and illustrations encourage one to trace historical parallels with cities elsewhere, and not only those in colonial contexts as witness cities such as Los Angeles and Lisbon.

Ronald Gill is similarly concerned with the historic heritage of expanding urban centres, in this case Jakarta. The problem is even more pressing here since Jakarta is expanding more rapidly. Thus, for example, despite a Monument Ordinance passed as early as 1931, the old town of Kota is in danger of disappearing forever given the planned construction of a multi-laned motorway right through the historic settlement. Gill looks at the use of urban memory maps and their contribution to urban plans to preserve or alter the environment against the backdrop of tourism and development and notes that, 'The prime factor will be a local assessment of the cultural-historical value of Kota for Indonesian society'. One must ask, however, which sector of Indonesian society?

An example of how precise one's focus may be is given in Marrik Bellen's paper in which the historical backgrounds, roles, and functions of

two institutions, the Batavian Theater (founded 1821) and the Batavian Art Circle, are examined. Not only did the growing number of European women play an increasingly important role in encouraging the emergence of such institutions – since they saw their establishment as evidence of urbane European society and its value – but, once established, these artistic activities as well as the buildings in which they took place gave impetus to and served as a home for Javanese art societies, linked to ‘a burgeoning Indonesian nationalism [...] [and serving as] the mouthpiece for Indonesian political aspirations’ (p. 105).

Nicole Niessen discusses the abrupt changes that were introduced to ‘Indonesian municipalities under Japanese rules’, not an easy task, given that the Japanese destroyed as many of their records as possible after their surrender in August 1945. What is especially interesting is the extent to which, a half century later, the municipal administration, ‘de-democratized’ during the brief three years of Japanese military rule, has not yet fully recouped losses such as the active participation of aldermen in city affairs.

Palembang is an ancient port city of Sumatra and its position on the important trade artery between India and China changed in response to the vagaries of history, leading it to feature, variously, as ‘capital city, pirate lair, and industrial city’. Both P.J.M. Nas and Jeroen Peeters concentrate on this cosmopolitan city, Nas’s work serving as a kind of introduction and historical overview to Peeters work which, in a paper entitled ‘Space, religion, and conflict: The urban ecology of Islamic institutions in Palembang’ (pp. 143-163), combines Bax’s concept of ‘religious regime’ with Foucault’s thesis that the social production of space is central to an understanding of the past and the distribution of power among urban groups. There is a fascinating and all too brief discussion of an intense conflict that erupted over the use of private cemeteries and engaged representatives from, among others, public administrators, neighbourhoods, conservative and reformist religious groups, affluent elite, low-status entrepreneurs, and so forth.

Another paper by P.J.M. Nas builds on the assumption that, ‘Cities are characterized by a specific configuration of symbols which, taken as a whole permit an insight into the unicity of the city’ (p. 164) and uses this to discuss the interface between tradition and tourism as they are mediated by such urban symbolism. Both fieldwork and travel guides were used to provide data for an analysis of the image of the provincial capital of Denpasar, Bali. Nas notes that, in addition to producing a richly variegated configuration of symbols, the tension, resulting from differing cognitive views and, thus, different development strategies, as these views are variously held by representatives of the traditional culture, the government (both local and national), and the tourist sector, is accountable for great harm.

The last three papers all focus on various aspects of development: Nico Schulte Nordholt, ‘New forms of urban infrastructural development policy

in Indonesia: A critical look at public-private partnership' (pp. 193-208); Fons Rietmeijer, 'Urban housing production in an institutional development perspective' (pp. 209-27); and Wim Stolte, 'From Jabotabek to Pantura' (pp. 228-45). Taken as a package, the picture painted by these three papers is not cheering. Schulte Nordholt makes a plea to recognize that economic cost-benefit calculations should be the basis for only a small part of political decision making when the destiny of so many people is at stake. Rietmeijer emphasizes the complexities in providing 'adequate' housing when a variety of actors (for example, the World Bank, government personnel, private developers, NGOs, those needing housing) are involved in a project requiring knowledge of infrastructural needs (for example, sewers, water, transportation), accounting skills, construction know-how, as well as both individual desires and socially embedded constraints in house and neighborhood building. Stolte, looks, first, at the Jabotabek Metropolitan Development Plan (JMDP) as it unfolded during the period 1980-1990, then as it is projected to continue to expand (its urban population growing from 13 million (1990 census) to 26-28 million) and, finally, as it will appear c. 2010 when, if current projections hold, it probably will more appropriately be designated as the Pantura regional development programme – namely, a region incorporating the present Pantura (the north coast of West Java, Pantai Utara) and the present region of Jabotabek. The magnitude is stunning and, when one reads, for example, that 'Deregulation measures of the Indonesian Government resulted in increased action by the Indonesia private sector [but] our findings showed [...] that less than half of the permits issued were in accordance with the existing plan', one cannot be sanguine that the projected development plans will unfold in the way envisaged. A paper I wrote concerning attempts to manage the future took as its title, 'What you want are results, what you get are consequences' (namely, unanticipated outcomes). This is usually true in development programmes and particularly, urban development programmes.

This is a sophisticated and tightly written group of papers, collectively addressing some of the most central as well as important but neglected areas of urban studies. What is depressing is that many researchers whose geographic focus is far removed from this part of the world will give it inadequate (if any) attention. As announced by an advertisement recently appearing in various financial publications, Indonesia, the fourth largest nation in the world and with a population of nearly 200 million, is 'a market equal in size to that of Germany, the UK and France combined, yet it continues to be missing in the global plans of many American and European corporations [...]. The World bank states that Indonesia economy could be the world's 6th largest by the year 2010.' That many scholars, especially those involved in urban development, global economics, or world systems studies, pay little heed to the scenarios unfolding in this part of the world is dismaying. Volumes such as this, addressing a wide range of



disciplinary concerns, deserve a wide audience if the more fundamental concerns of our research are to be given a more solid grounding.

---

Jan Becka, *Historical dictionary of Myanmar*. Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Press, xxii + 328 pp. [Asian Historical Dictionaries 15]. ISBN 0.8108.2840.5. Price: \$ 47.50.

UTA GÄRTNER

It is very timely right now, when Myanmar is poised to rejoin the international scene, that Volume 15 of Scarecrows' 'Asian Historical Dictionaries' has been devoted to this country.

Following the tradition of this series the book is well-organized with explanatory notes, an overview, and a hundred-page bibliography comprising a broad scope of publications on Myanmar. In a second edition an index might help the reader to find the respective entries more easily. The note on romanization and terms helps the reader to obtain a better understanding of the background to the so-called 'renaming' of the country in 1989, which the citizens of the Union generally do not perceive as such, and the strict usage of the names and spellings as prescribed by the government discloses a scholarly approach free of political bias. Another useful service to the reader is the list of abbreviations and acronyms as well as the chronology of events. The book covers the full range of history from the beginnings to the present, paying due attention to modern times. Moreover, relying on decades of close research into Myanmar the author also manages to furnish essential facts and information on related fields such as culture, economy, ethnography, geography and so forth in a very clear and concise way. This applies to both the introduction and the 212-page dictionary itself.

The great many cross-references furnish a network of complementary information. Especially valuable are the explanations of Myanmar words which occur in English or other non-Myanmar writings because there are no direct equivalents.

The entries on individual facts, such as persons, organizations, and places, are complemented by succinct surveys of important activities or events (for example, the independence movement, migration, military rule, national unity, the parliamentary era, pro-democratic movement and so forth), thus allowing the reader to see their historical and cultural context. The author's efforts to convey a true and balanced picture with a minimum of words generally succeed. Only very rarely do they produce what is perhaps a simplified assessment as in the case of the interrelations of Mons and Bamars throughout history which are more complex than the entry indicates, or of *Nat* worship as a part of popular Buddhism.

The introductory remark on Myanmar being a multi-ethnic state is substantiated by entries on about twenty ethnic groups and by references to the item in Federalism, Unitary State and so forth. The role of ethnicity throughout Myanmar history, however, would justify an entry of its own focusing, perhaps, on the genesis and the present situation of the issue. Moreover, including a list of the ethnic groups and their habitats in the annex of a second edition would contribute to an understanding of the complexity of the problem.

These few criticisms and some few printing errors (for example, giving Mt. Victoria a height of 11,200 m) cannot depreciate the merit of the work. Producing a great number of facts on a broad range of topics interconnected by thoughtful explanations, the book is a significant contribution to Myanmar studies on which the general reader as well as the more advanced student of Myanmar affairs can rely.

---

H. Slaats en K. Portier (eds), *Wilhelm Middendorp over de Karo Batak, 1914-1919. Deel 1*. Nijmegen: Katholieke Universiteit, Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid, 1994, xvii + 313 pp. [Reeks Recht en Samenleving 11]. ISBN 90.71478.6. Price: f 65.-.

BEATRIZ VAN DER GOES

In the course of his career, Wilhelm Middendorp (1886-1976), a socialist and Dutch civil servant, occupied such posts as Controleur of the Sub-district Karolanden (East Coast of Sumatra Residency) from 1914-1919, and Assistent-Resident in the Tapanuli Residency (Central Sumatra) from 1922-1923. During his postings in Kabanjahe and Sidikalang (Dairi), he collected data on various socio-cultural aspects of the Karo Batak of the highland plateau, and the Karo Batak of Dairi, with every intention of publishing an ethnological monograph. A 'European furlough' (1920-1922), and the one-year posting to Sidikalang were needed to put this in order, and at the end of 1923 the Dutch manuscript was completed. However, a sudden transfer to Sumba, a tragic event in his personal life, and demanding government positions for nearly a decade in both Celebes and Batavia took his full attention. As a result the publication of the monograph on the Karo Batak had to be postponed.

It was not until 1932, after his voluntary resignation from the civil service and his return to the Netherlands, that he looked at his material again. But during the Second World War his house was confiscated; parts of his manuscript were badly damaged, and some parts even lost forever. After the war he began to rewrite the remainder of his manuscript in the light of 'recent' scientific discussions. New ethnographic material was not added.

In two volumes (the first of which is now available) Slaats and Portier present a compilation of Middendorp's material on the Karo Batak, on which he worked from 1914 until his death in 1976. This first volume contains five revised chapters of the original manuscript, to which his biography and two of his earlier publications from the 1920s have been added. The unabridged reproduction of Middendorp's texts conjures up a lively picture from the pages of these chapters. The book contains a precise description of the environment, population, living conditions, adat, administration of justice, and martial law, as these were witnessed at the beginning of the twentieth century by a colonial civil servant trained in the spirit of the Ethical Policy, and developed by a socialist in the tradition of dialectical and historical materialism.

The ethnographical data make the book valuable, all the more so as it stands in sharp contrast to Middendorp's own interpretation of Karo Batak society. This was strongly influenced by his position as administrator, and by the evolutionistic paradigm prevailing at that time. In fact, Middendorp's data – providing evidence that it is through affinity that people acquire land or a position in the village social order (pp. 174-187) – question the current interpretation of Karo Batak society as consisting of patrilineal descent groups, and the practice of patrilocality. The text also clearly reveals that mythical narratives and local representations of their society have been interpreted in terms of the prevailing anthropological notions of linear history and unilinear descent, underestimating the various contexts and levels of Karo Batak social category of the *rumah* (house as exchange units). In their preface and postface to the chapters, the editors have not been able to re-adjust this image, as they themselves have been caught in these prevailing anthropological notions.

---

Janet Carsten and Stephen Hugh-Jones (eds), *About the house, Lévi-Strauss and beyond*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995, xiv + 300 pp. ISBN 0.521.47421.3 (hardback), 0.521. 47953.3 (paperback). Price US\$ 18.95 (pb).

STEPHEN C. HEADLEY

The study of 'sociétés à maison' stimulated by the writings and lectures of Lévi-Strauss in the early 1980s and taken a step further by the collective study centred on insular South-East Asia edited by Ch. Macdonald, rediscovers its original comparative dimension in this volume containing seven studies on Austronesian groups: Zafimarniry (Madagascar); Kelabit (Sarawak); Langkawi (peninsular Malaysia); Ara (South Sulawesi); Lio (Flores); and the South Moluccas; and three on lowland South American tribes: Carib-speaking groups of Guiana; the Mebengokre (central Brazil);

and Tukanoan (north-west Amazonia). An excellent introduction by the editors also serves as the conclusion pronouncing on the usefulness of Levi-Strauss' effort to come to grips with the phenomenon of 'sociétés à maison'.

The lack of consistent comparisons of 'sociétés à maison' in Levi-Strauss's treatment of Indonesia stems from the fact that one needs to be clear as to whether one is treating the relations within the House or between Houses (see S. Howell's remark, p. 152). Several of the authors here follow S. Errington (1987) in pointing out that the presence of a central trunk of cognatic societies in the middle of the Indonesian Archipelago, surrounded by unilineal societies to the east and west, require this contrast to be taken as a whole. Does Eastern Indonesia postulate unity, but institute fracture, while the central Archipelago institutes unity yet is haunted by duality? One answer to this question, already addressed in evolutionary terms by Louis Berthe in *Échanges et Communications* ('Parenté, Pouvoir et Mode de Production' 1970, vol. II, pp. 707-38), is proposed here by treating houses as extensions of the persons who inhabit them. Houses thus become the instruments of thought for many societies, wherein the body of the house serves to naturalize the social hierarchy. Domestic architecture may provide a link with the wider polity through the multiple and often contradictory symbolism of these dwellings. These studies often begin with architecture to provide a rich exploration of the imaginations of the minds of residents who 'see' the houses they inhabit both as inward-looking bodies and outward-looking groups. This links up to what James J. Fox has called the house as a ritual attractor in another recent volume on Austronesian Houses (1993:1).

The potential of this analytic tool (house as idiom when comparing social organizations within a single area) in lowland South America also rests on such justified comparisons. By temporarily leaving aside the problems posed by patrilineal descent, virilocal residence, group autonomy, the structure of hierarchy, and 'affinity as the problem underlying the Dravidian systems of Amazonia and their positive marriage rules' (p. 249), in the last chapter of this book, Hugh-Jones envisages the Maloca community from inside their Tukanoan with its multiple houses (food-giving house, world house, house of awakening, the Hé (secret initiation) house, and the androgynous house (inside female home and outside male façade)). Through the 'eyes' of the house, Tukanoan society stresses equality, interdependence, and consanguinity. And when Hugh-Jones contrasts the endogamous cognatic systems of the Guiana Caribs and the lineal systems of the Tukanoan, he notes that in Tanimbar McKinnon (in this volume) found 'differences in degree to which people conform to ideals of isogamy, virilocality and exogamy are related to social hierarchy' (p. 248). Comparative social morphology carried out in this manner is indeed enlightening.

Further cross-cultural comparative treatments of the idiom of siblingship

and symbolic siblings (analysed here by T. Gibson and J. Carsten for the Austronesian world) might provide a better understanding of house as process in those cognatic hierarchical kingdoms that have in the past hidden their lineages in worship communities (Bugis) or *trah* (central Java). The contributions made by the authors of this volume are very encouraging in this sense and the editors deserve our thanks. If the concept of 'sociétés à maison' has been set apart here it is not without very useful, if partial, applications.

---

James J. Fox (ed), *Inside Austronesian houses; Perspectives on domestic designs for living*. Canberra: Department of Anthropology, Research School of Pacific Studies, The Australian National University, 1993, x+237 pp. ISBN 0.7315.1595.1. Price: Aus\$ 25.-.

STEPHEN C. HEADLEY

This volume studies the ordered structures of space, time, and memory that lie at the 'origin' of houses amongst certain Austronesian ethno-linguistic groups. Three chapters concern Kalimantan (Borneo): those of J. Alexander on the Lahanan longhouse; C. Helliwell on the Gerai longhouse; and C. Sather on the Iban longhouse. C. Ng treats the spatial categories of the Minangkabau (Sumatra) house, paying special attention to the dominant role of women in its matrilineal organization. Ritual chants describing traditional houses provide J.J. Fox with much of his data. The traditional Termanu (Rotinese) house is 'an intermediate structure: in relation to the person, it is itself body and serves as a macrocosm [...] for ritual performance; in relation to a wider symbolic universe, the house is a microcosm that replicates the order of the world' (p. 142). Michael W. Young describes the secrets contained in the Kalauna house of Good-enough Island, secrets which are considered well-hidden by the non-descript character of their dwellings. By making a diachronic analysis of the continuing Maori reinterpretations of its architectural and ritual structure, Toon van Meijl provides an ethno-historical approach to the Maori *marae* or meeting house, showing how recent (nineteenth-century) it is, as well as its colonial origin. Two chapters, the introduction by J.J. Fox and R. Waterson's concluding survey of social relations and the social uses of space, provide an analytical background against which the comparative dimension of the ethnographies stands out.

The subtitle of this useful collection of articles does not do justice to the theoretical ambition of its authors. 'Domestic designs' are evoked, but so also is the social space of entire societies as acted out in the building and ritualized use of domestic dwellings. This is clear in the remarkable chapter

of C. Sather on the Iban longhouse in which a multitude of detail concerning the architectural structure of the dwelling is the occasion to describe multiple morphologies of the longhouse in terms of the ritual journeys that take place inside it. These orders, as Sather shows us, are 'constantly created and recreated by the participants themselves' (p. 105). Although Sather does not make many explicit comparisons to other Dayak groups, the formalization of his detailed data is so clear that it lends itself to comparative use. For instance, although societies like that of Java share very little in common with the Iban studied by Alexander, Helliwel, and Sather, (notwithstanding Rassers's famous essay of 1940 on the Javanese peasant house), the Dayak longhouse, resembles more the palace of the Javanese king by its ability to express the structure of a Dayak society in its entirety, than does the dwelling of the Javanese nuclear peasant family whose rituals are expressed in terms of their own bodies as often as those of their houses.

More comparisons with closely related societies of the type made at the end of Fox's chapter (see p. 176: Termanu; Ema (Timor), and Amarasi (Timor) houses would have been possible especially in Kalimantan. The editor (p. 6) admits as much. In his later contribution to *The Austronesian. Historical and Comparative Perspectives* (1995, pp. 214-28), Fox has laid the groundwork for a general social morphology of Austronesian societies. What this volume prefigures is, inter alia: a possible analysis of the gender of continuity, treated in several articles (Ng and Fox, p. 16); the comparative study of the clothes wrapped around key house pillars, with which cardinal directions the colours are associated; key moments in the life cycle; and a comparative analysis of the various burial practices: for umbilical cords, placentas, and corpses near or under the house. If such details are left in context (overlapping differences and similarities of making 'time' out of the memory of household rituals: erections of house posts, communal celebrations of secondary burials, annual displaying of heirlooms, and so forth), the use of the notion of 'memory palaces' might well prove to be a concept for articulating ethnographies between from what one senses are family resemblances (p. 23) into a full-blown comparative presentation of Austronesian 'houses'. An earlier study by H. Th. Chabot (*Verwantschap, Stand en Sexe in Zuid-Celebes*, 1950; translation KITLV Press, 1996) using the notion of the 'worship communities (*vereringsgemeenschap*)' has already shown the potential for relating lineage, household, and *pusaka* in such a way that the ancestors are linked to the social ambitions using kinship as their vehicle, all this occurring in a house, the dwelling of the extended family.

---

Helmut Buchholt and Ulrich Mai (eds), *Continuity, change and aspirations; Social and cultural life in Minahasa, Indonesia*. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 1994, vii + 231 pp. ISBN 981.301685.X (hardback), 981.301684.1 (paperback). Price S\$ 39.50 (pb).

M. HEKKER

For quite a number of decades the phenomenon of change or 'modernization' in non-Western societies has seemed to exercise a strong attraction for many social scientists. Many of the studies produced in this field tend to focus on change or modernization at the abstract level of a society as a whole, or at the other extreme, at the level of village or town. In this book, the authors focus on change in a specific region, namely Minahasa in North Sulawesi, Indonesia. The editors explicitly stress the fact that their approach is a regional one. In their opinion 'little has been written on subnational regions' and they present this 'collection of empirical studies on Minahasa [...] to fill the gap in the literature'. The editors state that Minahasa already formed a socio-cultural unit before the onset of the colonial period. In the nineteenth century, its population in its entirety was converted to Christianity, which consequently gave it a relatively strong orientation towards Dutch cultural values. Since the middle of the nineteenth century, Minahasa has been gradually integrated into the world market. Generally speaking, 'Minahasans have developed a distinctive bias in favour of modernity', the editors claim, although this influence should not be overestimated.

The theme of the book is change, understood in the sense of modernization. Notwithstanding the ongoing discussion on 'development' and 'modernization', there still is no consensus about the meaning of the word. The editors argue that processes of change are not unilateral nor do they occur simultaneously in all sectors of society and in the same way continuity and change are closely linked and modern and traditional elements coexist side by side in a developing society and their blending influences the character of a society.

The book is based on findings from research projects carried out under the auspices of the Research Centre of the Universitas Sam Ratulangi in Manado, Minahasa. Most research activities were part of the project 'Social and Cultural Aspects of Development'. The research was primarily based on ethnographic fieldwork and had a strong rural bias. Most of the research seems to have been carried out just after the middle of the 1980s.

The book contains twelve articles, including an Introduction written by the editors. These articles can be divided into three, partly overlapping, groups. The editors classify the first three articles as relevant to socio-historical and cultural aspects of development in Minahasa. Buchholt describes how the Christianization of Minahasa influenced the social

differentiation through the effects wrought by the educational system introduced by the missionaries. Lünemann describes the various Christian denominations as well as the indigenous religion. Kiem's article is dedicated to festive ritual and the generational differences revealed in the participation in them.

The subject of the second group of articles is local politics and social differentiation. Mai describes the association as a 'modern institution of socialization', by means of which modernization has penetrated Minahasan society. Weber describes the 'division of generations', and Schouten focuses on a similar theme, the difference between 'old and new elites'. An article written by Lalamentik, Ulaen, and Inkiriwang contains a case study of the role of women in rural Minahasa. Buchholt and Mai themselves cover the subject of local markets and trade, in the context of social differentiation.

The third group of articles covers economic and ideological aspects of regional development. Sondakh describes employment patterns in rural Minahasa, Buchholt again turns his attention to those recent social changes which coincide with economic changes and, finally, Weber discusses the influence of national development strategies on the local social system in terms of changing norms, values, and individual aspirations.

Looking critically at the respective articles, all cover a wide range of different aspects of modern Minahasan society. All articles are focused on change and most of them also contain a certain historical dimension by referring to the past, without really attempting to analyse historical developments. As is often the case in modernization studies, the authors show a preference for a fairly strong socio-economic note at the expense of certain ethnographic aspects like for instance kinship, indigenous religion, and adat law. Most articles present some fieldwork results, but these consist mainly of examples or of concise life histories. As factual descriptions, the articles lack a certain precision and offer fairly broad, generalizing descriptions. For instance, the *mapalus* association for mutual assistance figures in several articles, but a thorough analysis of, for instance, the different types, membership of women versus men, relation to social stratification, different financial systems and functional change, to mention just a few aspects, goes begging. In describing historical developments, it is surprising how little the authors have taken recourse to the vast wealth of nineteenth-century literature on Minahasa. At a more abstract level, the articles fail to offer any unexpected new ideas or analyses to challenge the present literature on Minahasa or social change.

In a collection of articles like this, each article is its author's own responsibility and it is difficult to judge the relationship between the articles. In this case, the articles apparently are the result of a common research project, so there a relationship, presumably alluded to by the editors in the Introduction may be assumed. Turning to the regional approach, many publications on Minahasa have in fact been written from a



regional perspective. When this approach is explicitly presented, the reader might have expected some discussion about the geographical and cultural delineation of the region. The same applies to the intra-regional differences between the various ethnic or linguistic areas within Minahasa, a subject which tends to be ignored in the book. When dealing with Minahasa, findings in a specific area cannot be generalized for all of Minahasa as a 'region'. Most articles cover only the southern part of Minahasa, neglecting the northern areas of Tonsea and Tombulu.

Moving on to the theme of continuity and change, a separate chapter on the theoretical aspects of these concepts and their relationship would not have gone amiss. The editors only refer to their ideas on this subject in very general terms. Their approach also seems to be representative of the respective authors of the articles. The adoption of such a theoretical stance can only lead to broad descriptions in which a certain stress is laid on change, without carrying out a thorough analysis of the subject. This approach bears within itself the risk of focusing too much attention on change in a non-Western society when this is seen from a 'Western' point of view.

What then has this book to offer? The reader should not expect striking new facts, ideas, or analyses. As a regional ethnography or sociological study, the book is not very convincing. Yet all is not lost, for those new to the field, the book offers an introduction to several aspects of present-day Minahasan society viewed from the perspective of change and modernization

---

Müller, Brigitte, *Op de wipstoel; De niet-gewettigde inheemse vrouw van de blanke Europeaan in Nederlands-Indië (1890-1940); Een literatuuronderzoek naar beeldvorming en werkelijkheid*. Amsterdam: Vakgroep Culturele Antropologie/Sociologie der Niet-Westerse Samenlevingen, 1995, xii + 131 pp. ISBN 90.6875.050.X.

TINEKE HELLWIG

Er zijn in de laatste tien jaren een aantal publicaties verschenen die niet alleen de aandacht vestigen op vrouwen in Indonesië en Nederlands-Indië, maar ook geschreven zijn vanuit een feministisch perspectief. Het was hoog tijd dat er een inhaalmanoeuvre van Indonesische vrouwenstudies plaatsvond, want dit is lange tijd een verwaarloosd gebied geweest, de uitgebreide kennis die we hebben over Indië en Indonesië ten spijt.

Brigitte Müllers *Op de wipstoel*, uitgegeven in de Serie Feministische Antropologie, vormt een interessante bijdrage aan de discussie. De centrale vraagstelling van deze studie is: 'Welke beelden over de niet-gewettigde

inheemse vrouw van de Europese man worden in literaire bronnen gecreëerd en gereproduceerd en in hoeverre doen deze beelden recht aan haar geleefde werkelijkheid?' (p. 2). Terecht gebruikt Müller de term 'njai' met de nodige voorzichtigheid vanwege de negatieve connotatie die dit woord vaak oproept. Ze begint haar betoog met een bespreking van Indische (Nederlandstalige) romans. Deze hebben tot nu toe het meest voor de hand liggende materiaal gevormd voor onderzoek naar het Indische concubinaat en het is daarom niet verwonderlijk dat hier een aantal gangbare karakterisering van de njai worden herhaald. Gelukkig echter geeft Müller in de rest van het boek aan dat haar blik verder reikt dan de stereotypen. Ze presenteert vervolgens allereerst een aantal Maleise en Indonesische literaire teksten die de koloniale stereotyperingen in een ander daglicht zetten. Ook besteedt ze aandacht aan de opvattingen van Kartini en Soewarsih Djojopoespito, inheemse vrouwen die kritisch schreven over wat ze om zich heen zagen. Zelf heb ik hoofdstuk vier met de meeste interesse gelezen omdat Müller daarin uiteenlopende bronnen aanboort: de biografische werken van Lin Scholte, fotomateriaal, alsmede het relaas van een informante die op Java geboren werd als kind van een ongehuwde Nederlandse vader en Balise moeder.

Müller besluit met de bespreking van eerder verschenen artikelen over koloniale sekseverhoudingen en genderpolitiek. Het is enigszins teleurstellend dat zij deze studies apart behandelt en de ideeën ervan niet op één of andere wijze heeft geïntegreerd in haar eigen onderzoek. Nu lijkt het alsof haar werk en dat van anderen geheel los van elkaar staan. Mijns inziens was ook een scherper geformuleerd theoretisch kader niet misplaatst geweest. Afgezien van de genoemde onderzoeksmethoden aan het begin, is er helaas weinig sprake van begrippen uit feministische (en/of postkoloniale) theorieën. We mogen echter niet uit het oog verliezen dat *Op de wipstoel* de neerslag is van een doctoraalscriptie, en als zodanig kunnen we niet anders dan concluderen dat Müller een waardevolle bijdrage heeft geleverd tot een beter inzicht in het bestaan van de njai.

---

Liaw Yock Fang, in collaboration with Munadi Padmadiwiria and Abdullah Hassan, *Speak Indonesian; A beginner's guide*. Singapore: Times Books International, 1990.

Liaw Yock Fang with the assistance of Nini Tiley-Noto-disuryo, *Standard Indonesian made simple*. Singapore: Times Books International, 1990.

Liaw Yock Fang, *Standard Malay made simple*. Singapore: Times Books International, 1988.

Liaw Yock Fang, *Speak standard Malay; A beginner's guide*. Singapore: Times Books International, 1993, xxii + 280 pp. ISBN 981.204.342.X.

JAN VAN DER PUTTEN

Learning a language is usually considered to consist of two major aspects: memorizing words and learning the rules of the grammar. Textbooks tend to emphasize one or the other: either departing from the rules of the grammar, contenting themselves with a few examples, or giving heaps of sentences and then formulating a concise rule that can be deduced from the text material. The four textbooks discussed here are clearly founded on the supposition that language acquisition is basically a matter of consuming as much text as one can cope with. Rules that govern sentences are not overly important: the reader will soon get the hang of it. Or, as the author puts it in the preface, the books are intended to help not to teach the readers, for 'language mastery is not possible through teaching alone. It must be learnt, the hard way.'

The textbooks help the readers to learn Standard Malay used in Malaysia and the standard language of its neighbour, Indonesia. For each standard variant of the Malay language there are two books: one conversation book (*Speak Indonesian/Standard Malay*) and one textbook with some grammar and exercises (*Standard Indonesian/Malay Made Simple*). The conversation books are divided into twenty chapters which each contains conversations on a certain subject, for example 'Hobbies and Leisures' (Chapter 8), 'In the Office' (Chapter 16), and 'One's Experience' (Chapter 19). They give the reader a fair amount of basic vocabulary with which to travel around in Malaysia or Indonesia. In these conversation books the author has been consistent in distinguishing between the specific Malaysian and Indonesian phrases, and rewriting some conversations for the revised Malay conversation book; the Indonesian book is the original. The introductions to both conversation books contain some notes on colloquial Malay with special reference to the Jakarta dialect in the Indonesian book.

The 'simple' textbooks are also divided into twenty chapters which are subdivided into four parts: A. one short conversation about the same subjects as those in the conversation books; B. sentence patterns which are the most important part of the lesson, as the author emphasizes in the preface; C. grammar which is kept to the minimum; D. word formation/word study which deals with some morphological intricacies of Malay and, in later chapters, gives some commonly used words with possible affixes used in context. A second part has been added to the *Indonesian Made Simple* book containing 'News Headlines' arranged into fifteen groups according to sentence patterns explained in the first part, 'Selected Readings' taken out of newspapers, a 'List of New Words and Terms' which, to my know-

ledge, are hardly, if ever, used and which are often inaccurately translated; and a 'Glossary of Acronyms and Abbreviations' which can be handy when reading Indonesian newspapers, but which regrettably are either incomplete or out of date. An addition with concise, simple texts is also appended to the *Malay Made Simple* book.

Bearing in mind the emphasis on language acquisition through learning words, one important omission in these books becomes immediately apparent: there are no lists containing the words used in the lessons. The Malay sentences are all translated into English, which tends to follow the original fairly accurately. However, there is no quick reference to words used and therefore it is difficult to build up one's vocabulary unless one should undertake to memorize all the sentences in the lessons. Should this indeed be the case, the reader would learn that *mengangkatkan* means 'to carry (something for?)', *melakukan* 'to sell', and *didatangi* 'attacked', to mention a few examples in which the translations in context do not concur with the actual meaning of the words. The *Standard Indonesian* textbook is a revised version of the *Standard Malay* book. The conversion was not accomplished with the same accuracy as was the case with the conversation books. In the Indonesian book the reader is told that forms like *berjahit* 'to be sewn' (sic) and *berjawab* 'to be answered' are in fact reciprocal. When we look in the original Malay book, we see that the heading 'passive' has been left out in the *Standard Indonesian* version. The classification of those forms as passive in a 'standard' textbook seems to be Malaysian [or Minangkabau?] influence and, without going into the question of whether these forms are indeed standard, it strikes me as odd that they are mentioned in a book that does not pay much attention to the grammar of the language. Malaysian influence is also apparent in the treatment of the prefix *ter-* in which the author suggests the accidental or sudden nature of the action as one of the most important modifications to the meaning of the verbs to which it is added. The author then produces sentences such as 'Polisi itu tertembak temannya' translated as 'The policeman shot his friend accidentally', whereas it seems to me that in most cases in Indonesia the policeman will have been hospitalized and his friend will have ended up in jail. In standard Indonesian the prefix *ter-* added to transitive verbs in most instances produces verbs in the passive voice with the meaning of 'the action has been performed' on the subject of the sentence, although there are some ambiguous examples as *termakan* '(accidentally) eaten (by)' or 'accidentally eating something'. Another tricky problem is the treatment of the prefix *me-* which is reported to be dropped easily in informal situations and headlines (except for *meninggal*), but 'students sitting for exams' are strongly advised to use it where it is applicable. But when, where, and why it is applied is not, or insufficiently, explained. It becomes more confusing when the formal changes of the prefix, discussed in Chapter 4, are followed by sentence patterns in which

the roots are used in Chapter 5, which is then followed by an exercise using the conjugated forms.

The books seem very popular as three of them have been reprinted several times. Especially the *Standard Indonesian Made Simple* could do with a revision, in which the translations of certain words should be carefully examined and the grammar should be treated succinctly but nonetheless accurately. Admittedly, the author's approach of confronting the readers with so many Malay sentences without paying much attention to vocabulary building or grammar has the advantage of producing very natural down-to-earth sentences and even gives him or her the chance to formulate the odd poetic sentence such as 'Apakah fajar sedang menyingsing' 'Is the day breaking'? I hope that the Malay language will 'dawn upon' the readers of these books and that they will not have been too confused to pass their exams.

---

Chr.G.F. de Jong, *Geschiedenis van de Nederlandse Zending op Zuid-Sulawesi 1852-1966; Een bronnenpublicatie*. Oegstgeest: Raad voor de Zending der Nederlands Hervormde Kerk, 1995, xi + 524 pp. ISBN 90.6572.130.4.

ALLE G. HOEKEMA

Deze uitgave is de vierde uit een reeks waarin de geschiedenis van de zending van Nederlandse protestantse kerken is vastgelegd middels publicatie van bronnen uit zendingsarchieven in ons land en in Indonesië. De eerdere delen, eveneens omvangrijk en alle verzorgd door Th. van den End, bevatten documenten betreffende de zending in Tanah Toraja, Sumba en West-Java. Dr Christiaan de Jong was de aangewezen persoon voor dit vierde deel. Vanaf 1983 is hij ruim tien jaar lang als kerkhistoricus verbonden geweest aan de Theologische Hogeschool te Ujung Pandang. Deze bronnenpublicatie sluit aan op zijn eerdere studie *Geesten, Goden en Getuigen* (Kampen, 1991), waarin hij de geschiedenis van de Nederlandse zending onder de Buginezen en Makassarers beschrijft.

De door Van den End verzorgde delen handelen over de zending van één kerk of organisatie in een bepaald gebied. De Jong stond voor de moeilijkheid, dat niet minder dan drie partijen in Zuid-Sulawesi werkten, te weten de Verenigde Nederlandse Zendingscorporaties ('Oegstgeest', vanaf 1950 de Raad voor de Zending van de Nederlandse Hervormde Kerk), de Protestantse Kerk in Nederlands-Indië, en de Gereformeerde Kerken. Hun arbeid strekte zich uit over vier van elkaar gescheiden gebieden: het eiland Selayar, Ujung Pandang zelf, het gebied van Gowa en dat van Soppeng. De Jong's gerechtvaardigde keuze om de gepubliceerde bronnen strikt chronologisch op te nemen heeft als noodzakelijk nadeel, dat de

lezer nogal eens van het ene naar het andere gebied, en van de ene naar de andere zendingsorganisatie moet springen. Dat maakt het niet eenvoudig inzicht te krijgen in deze complexe regionale zendings- en kerkgeschiedenis.

Hoewel het boek de geschiedenis vanaf 1852 behandelt, toen het Nederlandsch Zendeling Genootschap W.M. Donselaar als eerste zending naar Zuid-Sulawesi zond, ligt de nadruk op de periode na 1930. Slechts zes documenten uit het tijdvak vóór 1930 zijn opgenomen. Toevoeging van enkele documenten van de bijbelvertaler B.F. Matthes (zie over hem J.L. Swellengrebel, *In Leijdeckers Voetspoor I*, 1974, VKI 68) had aan de beginperiode meer kleur kunnen geven. Dat strookte echter waarschijnlijk niet met de begrenzing, die de redactiecommissie zich moest stellen.

Het meest interessant zijn die documenten, waarin we lezen over adatkwesties, en over ontmoetingen met de islam, of met de syncretistische Binanga Benteng-beweging op Selayar. Ook van belang zijn de etnische problemen, die binnen de christengemeenschappen regelmatig opdoemen: slechts een deel van de christenen in Zuid-Sulawesi behoort tot de Buginezen en Makassaren. Veel documenten hebben te maken met het moeilijke proces van samenwerking tussen alle partijen en met het autonome optreden van verschillende evangelisten uit het gebied zelf. Vooral Denso (Syamsuddin Daeng Soreang) en Daeng Massikki moeten krachtige figuren geweest zijn. Deze kwesties komen pas tot een voorlopige afronding, als de drie genoemde groeperingen in 1966 ruimte scheppen voor een zelfstandige kerk. Opvallend is, dat de nationale beweging tot 1940 nauwelijks vermeld wordt, en dat de grote politieke en militaire troebelen op Sulawesi in de jaren vijftig slechts als achtergrond meeklinken in de brieven en rapporten van de zendelingen. Overigens is bijna een derde van alle documenten in vertaling opgenomen en afkomstig van Indonesiërs.

De Jong heeft gezorgd voor een uitgebreid en zorgvuldig voetnotenapparaat en voor verschillende bijlagen, waaronder biografische gegevens over vele *dramatis personae*. Mede daardoor vormt deze bronnenpublicatie, tezamen met zijn eerdere studie, een zeer waardevolle bijdrage tot onze kennis van dit stuk kerkgeschiedenis.

---

Ronald G. Gill, *De Indische stad op Java en Madura; Een morfologische studie van haar ontwikkeling*. Delft: Publikatiebureau Bouwkunde, Technische Universiteit Delft, 1995, 350 pp. ISBN 90.5269.167.3.

GEORGE HOTZE

Stedebouw in de grote steden van Indonesië staat in het teken van prestigieuze architectuur van identiteitloze geïmporteerde glas- en betonbouw en grootse stadsaanleg, kort gezegd modernisme zonder herkenbaar eigen cultureel gezicht. De roep om steden met een eigen karakter en kenmerken die aansluiten bij de aspiraties van de lokale Indonesische bevolking neemt echter sterk toe. Gill onderzoekt in zijn studie de ruimtelijke concepten en patronen van de vroegere Nederlands-Indische steden op Java en Madura teneinde inzicht in de ontwikkeling ervan te verkrijgen en te bezien hoe vitaal die concepten eventueel voor hedendaags gebruik zijn en aan het terechte verlangen naar nationale identiteit tegemoet komen. Hij doet dit door een beschrijving en analyse van de morfologie van deze steden te geven en constateert dat vooral in de negentiende-eeuwse nederzettingen zo'n waardevolle ruimtelijke karakteristiek zit dat die wat hem betreft tot cultureel erfgoed verheven kan worden en een plaats in de hedendaagse stedebouw verdient.

In Deel 1 typeert hij de steden als volgt naar de belangrijkste periodes: hindoe-javaanse en islamitisch-Javaanse dorpen, factorijsteden en Hollandse koopmanssteden uit de VOC-periode, de negentiende-eeuwse oude en nieuw-Indische steden, de koloniale en post-koloniale steden. Met name deze laatste post-koloniale steden, gebouwd als satelliet-'New town', hebben dan weer last van het gewraakte fenomeen van nationale prestige-stedebouw en zijn voorbeelden van gemiste kansen. Dat is een doorn in het oog, maar valt de Indonesische overheid echter nauwelijks te verwijten. Een traditie op stedebouwkundig gebied heeft zich immers in de nadagen van de koloniale tijd niet kunnen ontwikkelen hoewel toen belangrijke architecten van eigen bodem zijn voortgebracht.

Deze architecten worstelden, als overal elders, met de vraag of ze nu de voorbeelden van koloniale bouwstijl moesten volgen of niet. Gill illustreert dit treffend met het door Berlage (of Wren) geïnspireerde ontwerp voor Dermo van Maclaine Pont en met de ruzie tussen Soesilo en Van Romondt over het ontwerp van Kebayoran Baru.

In hoofdstuk 3, dat de opmaat vormt tot het hart van de studie in Deel 3, wordt met grote wetenschappelijke diepgang en volledigheid een meer culturele typering van de nederzettingen gegeven, gekoppeld aan landschapstypen en ordeningsschema's die gebaseerd zijn op traditionele ceremonies en religieuze rituelen, in dit geval de Islam maar ook de oorspronkelijke Javaanse hindoeïstisch-boeddhistische religie en de Javaanse woonercultuur, waar nog archetypen van zijn overgebleven. Veel van deze traditie is ruimtelijk herkenbaar gebleven ook in de periode van het dubbelbestuur, dat in de negentiende eeuw, na de VOC-periode, ontstond. In Deel 3 blijkt hoe harmonieus het Europees-inlandse resident-regentsbestuur met zijn gescheiden adatrechtspraak, de bestuursindeling van gewesten en districten, de aanleg van de postweg en de spoorwegen, zich in de ruimtelijke lay-out van de nederzettingen met elkaar verdroegen. Hier bovenop kwam nog de uit 1838 daterende bijdrage van de Nederlandse

stedebouw in de vorm van de circulaire die profielen, kavelafmetingen en de aanplant van bomen voorschreef. Dit is te oordelen naar de buitengewone invloed die het heeft gehad op karakter en sfeer in de Indische stad een uniek document. De voorgeschreven afmetingen van hoofd- en zijwegen, respectievelijk 20 en 15 meter, voegden zich perfect naar de plaatsgeving van gebouwen, waaronder de gevangenis, rond de alun-alun, het centrale ceremoniële plein met de voorgeschreven noord-zuid-lopende asrichting. Met het aanwezige kaartmateriaal uit die periode lukt het vele dorpen op systematische wijze te documenteren. Er blijft weliswaar een Europees aandeel in de ordening, maar het totaal levert een onmiskenbare ruimtelijke karakteristiek van een respectabele cultuur op. Het plantype van die karakteristiek heeft, en dat toont Gill aan, moeiteloos veranderingen in het functioneel programma van latere tijden kunnen bevatten. Deze bewijsvoering vindt vooral plaats in hoofdstuk 6 waar de ruimtelijke transformaties van Banyumas en Probolinggo worden geanalyseerd. Dit zijn tevens de echte en sterkste morfologische analyses van de dissertatie met juweeltjes van stadsbeschrijvingen, die met schetsen en foto's van woningtypen en ruimtelijke configuraties worden verlucht.

Ik vraag me af of de methode van morfologische analyse zoals Gill die hanteert en deze twee voorbeelden wel genoeg zijn om in voldoende mate aan de doelstelling te beantwoorden. Met meer voorbeelden, die vooral de ontwikkeling tot in de huidige tijd zouden laten zien, zou de bewijslast toegenomen zijn. De stadsmorfologie als onderzoeksmiddel wordt door Gill niet volledig uit de doeken gedaan. Is het voor buitenstaanders begrijpelijk als Gill zegt: morfologie is de vorm die het type aanneemt? Het is toch zaak met morfologisch onderzoek 'de geschiedenis van het ruimtelijk sleutelen' (Geurtsen 1988) aan de nederzetting te illustreren, vast te leggen met historisch topografisch materiaal. Dat doet Gill wel, maar hij demonteert en reduceert weinig. Interessant zou zijn geweest te onderzoeken of zijn longitudinale plantype niet bedreigd wordt door het raster waar het deel van uit is gaan maken en of een terugkeer naar het weer laten domineren van de as in het raster mogelijk is. Een typologische cyclus dus (Castex 1984 en 1993). Methodisch-stedebouwkundig miste ik een plaatsing in de internationaal stedebouwkundige vakontwikkeling. Castex beschrijft toch vele voorbeelden van ingrepen van machthebbers in stadslichamen en hoe daar waarde en betekenis aan toegekend kunnen worden. Met name zou verband kunnen worden gelegd met de voorlopers van de negentiende-eeuwse tuinstadgedachte van Unwin en Sitte en de Engelse landschapsschool.

De tekeningen in het boek van Gill zijn moeilijk leesbaar vooral omdat ze, op de genoemde twee cases na, niet als serie zijn weergegeven. In een seriematige weergave wordt de ontwikkelings- en veranderingsdynamiek makkelijker voor niet-stedebouwkundigen afleesbaar en begrijpbaar. Misschien was het aanwezige kaartmateriaal daar niet geschikt voor. Vakgenoten zullen er echter minder moeite mee hebben. Eigenlijk is door de



overigens voortreffelijke classificatie de studie meer als een typologische atlas dan een morfologische analyse te beschouwen.

Toch blijft verder iets tweeslachtigs in de studie zitten. Enerzijds heeft het Europees bestuur een ruimtelijke invloed gehad, anderzijds blijken aspecten van dat bestuur als de bijbehorende vestingwerken nauwelijks invloed op het ruimtelijke patroon te hebben gehad. Hoe die geringe ruimtelijke exponent van de macht verklaard moet worden blijft onduidelijk. Op welke wijze is dan die uitheemse cultuur doorgedrongen? Hoe is dat met de ogen van vandaag te waarderen? En dan heb ik het maar niet over de veroveringsoorlogen ten tijde van de Ethische politiek waar Gill waarschijnlijk aan voorbij gaat omdat de ruimtelijke consequenties misschien niet groot waren. Zo hij de assimilatie al toeschrijft aan de Javaanse harmonie en gemeenschapszin van toen, hoe kijken dan de huidige Indonesiërs tegen dit verleden aan als deze in symboliek tot uitdrukking zou gaan komen in moderne stedenbouwkundige ontwerpen met ruim opgezette, nauwkeurig georiënteerde alun-aluns? Roept dat geen herinnering op aan feodale sultaneske ceremonies en koloniale onderdrukking? Ik laat echter graag Gill hierin de exponent van het Indonesië van vandaag zijn. Misschien is het ook meer een convergentie van Aziatische en Europese culturele aspecten geweest dan koloniale invloed. Arabische en Chinese invloeden zijn even groot zo niet groter geweest, terwijl de Javaanse woon-erfcultuur dat allemaal geassimileerd en overleefd heeft. Het is aan hem om in te schatten of restauratie en terugbouwen van negentiende-eeuwse ruimtelijke configuraties het verwijt zou kunnen treffen van nostalgie naar de tijden van weleer.

Bouwkundig miste ik de behandeling en plaatsbepaling van de zogenaamde 'Indische Architectuur', hoewel Gill Maclaine Pont en Aalbers wel noemt. Deze vroeg-twintigste-eeuwse architectuur bevat vele potentiële monumenten en wordt door moderne bewegingen als ARSI (opgericht in 1986) eveneens tot cultureel erfgoed gerekend.

De grote verdienste van Gill schuilt in de prioriteit die hij geeft aan stedelijke samenhang. Bovendien beantwoordt hij de vraag of de koloniale periode de traditionele nederzittingsstructuur ingrijpend heeft gewijzigd, wat je wel verwacht zou hebben, duidelijk ontkennend. De traditionele nederzittingsstructuur blijkt tegen meer bestand dan een koloniaal intermezzo en heeft een prachtige ruimtelijke vorm. Of die ruimtelijke vorm, ondanks Gills pleidooi, bestand zal blijven tegen 'modernisatie' is de vraag. Schrikbarend is de foto op blz. 289, waar de prachtige voormalige Heerenstraat te Probolinggo tussen 1988 en 1990 zijn bomen blijkbaar verliest door 'de aanleg van een trottoir'. Gill noemt dit 'ingrijpend'. Ik zou het in een dissertatie een achteruitgang in kwaliteit van de eerste orde hebben genoemd. De studie zou op dit soort punten meer waarde, betekenis, richtsnoeren en aanbevelingen voor de lezer moeten bevatten. Daar horen dan mijns inziens ook aanbevelingen bij over de vormen van inspraak en bestuur waarmee de culturele identiteit van de eigen bevolking meer

uitdrukking kan krijgen. Gill heeft desondanks een grote, goed geschreven, zij het door het ontbreken van een register minder toegankelijke, bijdrage geleverd aan de cultuurhistorische kennis van zijn eigen geboorteland, die hopelijk door veel mensen gelezen wordt.

#### *Literatuur*

- Castex, J., 1984, *De rationele stad, van bouwblok tot wooneenheid*, Nijmegen.  
 —, 1993, *De architectuur van renaissance, barok en classicisme; Een overzicht*. Nijmegen.  
 Geurtsen, R., 1988, *Locatie Zuidpoort Delft; Stadsmorfologische atlas*, Delft.

---

Holk H. Dengel, *Neuere Darstellung der Geschichte Indonesiens in Bahasa Indonesia; Entwicklung und Tendenzen der indonesischen Historiographie*. Stuttgart: Steiner, 1994, vii + 269 pp. ISBN 3.515.06617.9.

H.A.J. KLOOSTER

In Germany at the moment there are two authors who concern themselves primarily with modern Indonesian historiography. Quite recently, in 1993 to be exact, Klaus Schreiner-Brauch defended his doctoral dissertation on the worship of national heroes at Hamburg University (see my review in BKI 150 p. 435). Holk H. Dengel, who obtained his PhD in 1986 at Heidelberg University with a study of Darul Islam, is also a compiler of bibliographies in the field of history. His latest piece of work, which is reviewed here, consists mainly of a list of books and papers, written by Indonesians on a great variety of subjects, ranging from archaeology to the 30 September Coup. Dengel's list, which does not include magazine articles, consists of some 2000 titles, an impressive number at first glance, but historical production in Indonesia in fact is still very much greater. The KITLV library, which Dengel visited in addition to his forays to many Indonesian institutions, already contains far more historical publications by Indonesians. The grounds on which he made his selection are obscure. Titles are arranged in alphabetical order with no further attempt to introduce any divisions, limiting the usefulness of the bibliography. There is also no indexing, a serious handicap if one is looking for specific items. Because the emphasis falls principally on titles in Indonesian, some essential studies have been left out, including the dissertations of the leading historians Sartono Kartodirdjo and Taufik Abdullah, which were written in English and defended abroad. Sartono's dissertation on the peasants' revolt of Banten is mentioned separately in a footnote in one of the short chapters preceding the bibliography.

These introductory chapters contain useful information, such as an overview of the national and regional seminars in the field of history. Obviously, historical research in Indonesia is impeded by the many extra-curricular activities historians have to pursue to make ends meet, diverting their attention from the essentials of their profession. Students have to occupy themselves with obligatory courses on political education, which consume much of their time.

Dengel chose a number of central items in modern Indonesian historiography around which to group the literature. Some of these items are treated fairly briefly. One good example of this is the Indonesian revolution, a topic which could easily fill a whole monograph, but which has less than two pages devoted to it.

The factors which are adduced above, must lead us to conclude that Dengel's bibliography suffers from a lack of accessibility and elaboration. Moreover, it displays a carelessness in spelling matters; Dutch names and phrases especially are the frequent victims of misspelling. On a more positive note, some important developments in the historical field are described. These are necessary for an understanding of the position of history in Indonesian education and research, and, not at least, the role of the government in designing a picture of the past.

---

Hans Antlöv and Stein Tønnesson (eds), *Imperial policy and Southeast Asian nationalism 1930-1957*. Richmond: Curzon Press, 1995, xiii + 323pp. ISBN 0.7007.0319.5. Price £ 35.-.

HARRY A. POEZE

This well-edited volume brings together ten papers, which were read in Copenhagen in May 1993 at a conference of the Nordic Institute of Asian Studies. They examine the role of the European empires in the process that transformed Southeast Asia from a collection of colonial states into independent nations. The introduction, a single bibliography and two indexes, all meticulously compiled, are intended to create the impression that the volume is more than just a collection of ten, rather diverse, papers on a crucial period in Southeast Asian history. In their introduction Antlöv and Tønnesson rightly conclude that it was not an imperialist-nationalist dichotomy, but a far more complicated pattern that determined the course of events, and they bring forward a number of triangular relations – colonialism, communist, and non-communist nationalism; colonial power, local nationalist movements, and Japanese or Chinese occupation forces; local, national, and international levels; colonial, national, and dynastic leaderships; colonial power, nation-state, and ethnic minorities. All of which find their way into the contributions in the volume but, unfortun-

ately not in a coordinated or inclusive manner. The editors have grouped the articles into five pairs; the effort is brave, but in vain, and leaves the reviewer admiring their inventiveness in attempting to unite what cannot be united. The 'artificial' pairings should not distract from the high quality of most of the articles, based on thorough research in archives and literature, also written in Vietnamese, Chinese, and Indonesian/Malay, where appropriate.

Five may be said to use a comparative perspective extremely useful in the Southeast Asian context, but the efforts in this respect often did not succeed as real expertise on more than one or two of the highly different states is rarely to be found combined in one person. This is true of the fairly sketchy survey that Anthony Short presents in the first contribution, and to a lesser extent, for Anders Tanstrup, who points out the common feature of 'village wars' in the region. Stein Tønnesson on the 'filling of the power vacuum' in 1945 in Indonesia, the Indies, and Malaya, Hans Antlöv on the role of three traditional rulers – Sultan Ibrahim of Johore, Emperor Bao Dai of Vietnam, and Sultan Hamengku Buwono of Yogyakarta – and Anne L. Foster on the French, Dutch, British, and US reactions to the Nghe Tinh Rebellion in Vietnam, 1930-1931, are among the rare successful examples of comparative history for this period.

Four other articles are detailed studies which supply new information or revise and reappraise present interpretations on their specific subjects. William A. Frederick 'debunks' the enigmatic, high-ranking, Dutch colonial government official Charles van der Plas, a (semi-)legendary figure among his Indonesian counterparts during the thirties and forties – 'A man who knew too much'. Lin Hua writes about the Chinese occupation – on behalf of the victorious Allied armies – of Northern Vietnam in 1945-1946, while Oscar Saleminck analyses the tragic lot of the Montagnards, ethnic minorities in the strategic highland of Vietnam, who were courted by the French as well as by the communist Viet Minh. Karl Hack argues convincingly that local forces determined the outcome of Malayan decolonization, rather than the efficaciousness of British designs, *inter alia* also introducing some new accents concerning the Malayan Emergency or Civil War. An interesting point of view is developed by Jan Aart Scholte who stresses the international dimension in the construction of Indonesian nationality, which by analogy would also hold true for other countries in the region. It is a refreshing reversal of the way in which colonialism is generally looked upon, but on the other side of the coin probably not as new or original as suggested. As a whole the volume is, thus, a diverse, inspiring collection, that unfortunately is far too highly priced.

---

Michael Hill and Lian Kwen Fee, *The politics of nation building and citizenship in Singapore*. London: Routledge, 1995, x + 285 pp. ISBN 0.415.10052.6 (hardback), 0.415.12025.X (paperback).

P.W. PRESTON

Hill and Lian have produced a thorough, detailed, and conventional political history of post-Second World War Singapore. The text is based on available published material. The text is thorough in that it discusses the key elements of the political history of the period. The text is detailed in that it pays attention to the available literature within its chosen sphere of concern. The text is conventional, and is so in several ways: (1) the focus of the text is on the post-Second World War period; (2) the material presented is largely uncritical; and (3) the story told is one of success secured by a skilled expert elite. Hill and Lian's tale contains no new empirical or theoretical material but the text does usefully bring some otherwise perhaps rather scattered material into a single text.

Hill and Lian argue, in their opening chapter, that citizenship in Singapore should be read not in terms of the traditions of liberal-democratic individualism but in terms of the more communitarian tradition of civic republicanism, where this implies a shift from a concern with rights to a focus on duties. Thereafter, what is at issue is the way in which the elite in power set about constructing a nation and a notion of citizenship.

Hill and Lian review the ways in which the PAP elite has sought to construct a nation and along with it ideas of citizenship over the post-Second World War period. Having identified, in their second chapter, the urgent demands faced by the PAP of an unexpected independence and with it an ethnically diverse population, they go on to look at the education provision, ethnic relations, and housing policy, and they identify a series of ways in which the PAP government has secured control and order via strategies of social engineering.

The early period of PAP rule is taken to have been driven by the politics of survival but in more recent years, as economic success has advanced, the arena of concern for nation and citizenship has shifted. A more prosperous population has shown signs of resisting the engineering style of the PAP which has replied with a series of attempts to manage the ideological sphere: from religion, to shared values, to family values to the promulgation of a national ideology. It is in the recent debate about civic society that Hill and Lian see signs of a movement towards an explicitly voiced communitarian civic republicanism.

In all, the text is a useful synthesis of the existing literature on Singaporean nationhood and citizenship.

---

Michael Southon, *The navel of the perahu; Meaning and values in the maritime trading economy of a Butonese village*. Canberra: Department of Anthropology, Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies, The Australian National University, 1995, xiv + 150 pp. ISBN 0.7315.2115.3.

J.W. (PIM) SCHOORL

Michael Southon's study is a welcome and valuable contribution to our knowledge about Buton (Sulawesi Tenggara) and its important role in the sailing traffic in Eastern Indonesia. From time immemorial the Butonese, together with the Bugis and the Makassarese, have played a dominant role in these maritime activities in the eastern part of the Archipelago. In his foreword Professor Fox, under whose guidance the research and writing of this study took place, refers to the designation 'BBM', well-known in Eastern Indonesia, which is a colloquial reference to the the Butonese, Buginese, and Makassarese. These people have dominated the spontaneous migration streams in Eastern Indonesia, including Irian Jaya. A migration which has been stimulated by their sailing skills.

One of the great services of the book is the way in which it links sailing as a source of livelihood to the rituals and social institutions that underpin it in a particular community.

The scene is set in Chapter I which gives a description of the village (*desa*) Gerak Makmur on the Bay of Lande at the southern end of the island Buton. This *desa* is a composite of five settlements (*dusun*), of which two are oriented towards agriculture. Their inhabitants are the descendants of the original settlers of this area. The other three *dusun* are home to the newcomers who settled along the shores and whose main occupations are sailing, trading, and fishing. Data about the social structure, the history and boat ownership throw a great deal of light on their way of life.

One of the main kernels of the study is contained in Chapter II, which deals with 'the perahu economy', placed in the historical context of the *perahu* (proa or prau) economy in Eastern Indonesia. The present trade routes, governed by the winds and the cargoes, are described. The sections about the institutions for borrowing *perahu*, for regulating the relations between the boat-owner, the captain and the crew, and for dividing the profits from a voyage, are especially rewarding.

In Chapter III the emphasis shifts briefly to 'the economic relationship between houses and boats'. The important statistics it contains elucidate incomes per sailing trip and the division of profits.

Symbolism provides the theme for Chapter IV which 'gives an account of symbolism, firstly in the physical structures of the house and boat, and secondly in the social institutions surrounding the voyage'. In this culture houses are female and boats are male. This equation is symbolically achieved by incorporating measurements from the wife and the husband in the

house and in the boat, respectively. The author shows how technical knowledge and skills are interwoven with ritual (religio-esoteric) knowledge.

In the last chapter (V), Michael Southon shows that the *perahu* is also firmly anchored in the economic and political domain, an arena in which individuals gain prestige through the acquisition and demonstration of various types of esoteric knowledge. He argues that the *perahu* is a vehicle that translates spiritual power into political power.

As I said at the very beginning, Southon's study is a welcome contribution to knowledge about Buton society and culture, especially the way in which it elucidates important aspects of the sailing activities of the Butonese. As such this study lays a firm foundation for further studies about the sailing activities of the Butonese, the beliefs and symbolism involved, and the socio-cultural context in which these activities take place.

There are still a few minor questions:

– I am puzzled as to why the name Zahari *Milku* is used whereas I have never heard any name for him other than (Abdul) *Mulku* Zahari. He wrote many books and articles about Butonese culture and history and was my most important informant during research (1981) in the field and afterwards by correspondence till his unfortunate and untimely death.

– It is a pity that the Internet communications between the KITLV and the ANU, two excellent centres of knowledge about Indonesia, are or were not yet developed to such an extent that Southon could have been aware that I had published four more articles about Buton culture and society other than the two which he mentions ('Schoorl [...] has published two papers', p. 8). I agree this is still not enough to correct the impression that I was mostly 'concerned with the history of state formation on Buton' and also did 'some ethnographic research on religious beliefs'.

– A small error has crept into the foreword. The area of the former sultanate is not included in one single administrative unit, the *kabupaten* Buton, but in two (p. IX). The other one is the *kabupaten* Muna. The sultanate had already been divided into two *kabupaten* before it was abolished in 1960. La Ode Manarfa promoted this division during his father's reign as sultan, in order to make it possible for Sulawesi Tenggara to become a province, by having then the three requisite *kabupaten* (personal communication). The map which is referred to also shows this division (p. 19).

I recommend this study to all who are interested in Buton, developments in Eastern Indonesia, sailing activities in (Eastern) Indonesia, and esoteric knowledge related to sailing. The book is nicely printed and illustrated.

Geoffrey Robinson, *The dark side of paradise; Political violence in Bali*. Ithaca/London: Cornell University Press, 1995, xxii + 341 pp. ISBN 0.8014.2965.X. Price US\$ 38.-.

HENK SCHULTE NORDHOLT

This is a brilliant book that must be read by anybody interested in modern Indonesia. Robinson wrote an exemplary local history in which persistent myths concerning cultural explanations of Balinese politics are demolished by showing how political processes, conflicts, and eventually the massacre of 1965-1966 can only be understood within a wider analytical framework in which the interaction between external and local states is of crucial importance.

The main question is a simple one, but has received extremely little attention in the academic world: How was it possible that from December 1965 till February 1966 80,000 Balinese, namely 5 per cent of the population, were killed in the aftermath of the September Coup in Jakarta? Some have tried to explain the blood-bath in terms of Balinese trance, cosmic imbalance, and ritual purification, but Robinson argues convincingly that such an approach has no analytical value. Instead, it serves the interests of the New Order regime by obscuring who the actual killers were, when and how they committed their crimes, and why.

Turning away from cultural explanations Robinson demonstrates that from the beginning of the twentieth century external states have influenced the outcome of the changing power relationships between regional and local figurations in Bali. In doing so it becomes clear that national politics in the post-war period were not just absorbed into traditional feuds between local factions; the struggle for power in Bali was the product of a dynamic interplay between national, regional, and local forces. It was this interplay that created new conditions, shifting alliances, new conflicts, and in the end the tragic circumstances under which so many people were killed.

Except for the colonial period when the Dutch established a power monopoly, Balinese history has been characterized by violence because of the fairly weak level of integration at the regional level. In Chapters 2-4 Robinson provides an outline of the main developments between 1900 and 1945. The seeming tranquillity during the colonial period has wrongly been identified as an essential characteristic of Balinese culture. Cogently, the absence of open conflict did not mean that there were no tensions. The uneven distribution of land, the powerful position of local kings within the system of indirect rule, the regulation of caste relationships, and, above all, the heavy burden of colonial taxation raised new conflicts within Balinese society. During the 1930s large parts of the population were impoverished because Bali paid two-thirds of all the taxes from the Outer Islands. During the Japanese occupation tensions between collaborating members of the



aristocracy and commoners intensified, while poverty increased and mass mobilization and military training created a militant youth that was not willing to welcome a return of the Dutch.

Chapters 5-7 discuss the complex interplay of external and internal forces during the revolution. Bali was caught between the Republic in Yogya and the pro-Dutch state of Eastern Indonesia (NIT), while within the island both moderate and radical revolutionaries, and weak and strong kings either tried to survive or to annex regional power. When the Dutch finally returned to the island in March 1946 they were faced with a strong resistance movement and were soon involved in guerrilla warfare. Robinson gives a detailed and well-documented picture of the complexities during this period which includes economic developments, caste issues, rivalries within the aristocracy and among the revolutionaries as well as between Dutch civil servants and the military. The outcome of these shifting figurations can only be understood if developments at the national level are taken into account. The majority of the revolutionary guerrilla forces decided for instance to surrender in May 1948, because the Republic had recognized the NIT at the Renville Conference earlier that year. It is also interesting to contemplate that the NIT was not purely a Dutch puppet state. Both the president (Cokorda Soekawati) and the prime minister (Anak Agung Gde Agung) of the NIT were Balinese and clashed with senior Dutch civil servants in Bali (Boon and Van Baal) over issues in which their personal interests were involved. As a result the Dutch civil servants lost their case and were removed from their positions.

In 1950 the revolution in Bali was by no means over, and local violence, including hundreds of killings, continued till 1957. The formation of political parties (PSI, PNI, and later PKI) and new alliances (between administrative, political and military factions) were partly a result of struggles for power dating from the revolution, but they were also informed by developments at the national level. In Chapters 7-10 Robinson explores the period between 1950 and 1965 about which very little has been written. Bali was in this period by no means an isolated part of Indonesia but depended in various respects heavily on the centre of the nation-state. It is impossible to summarize here all the events and developments in that period. One of the most striking features is the extent to which local and national politics became intertwined. Governor Suteja (1950-1965) manifested himself as a replica of Soekarno, and the rise of the PKI in Bali in the late 1950s reflects its growth at the national level. Also the alliance between the PKI and the governor in Bali runs parallel to the rapprochement between the party and President Soekarno.

In a separate chapter Robinson deals with economic developments. Bali depended for 90 per cent on revenues from Jakarta and as a result of inflation, low wages, shortage of land, crop failures, and the eruption of Gunung Agung in 1963 class conflict increased. In this context the PKI created a mass base which was mobilized during the campaigns for land

reforms in the early 1960s, which resulted in increased tension and conflicts. Robinson emphasizes that class did matter in those years. Special attention is also paid to the shifting role of the military and police forces in Bali at that time.

In this situation the coup and counter coup in Jakarta in 1965 had dramatic reverberations in Bali. The PKI soon lost its major allies and was isolated, but it took two months before the final reckoning started. In Chapter 10 Robinson describes the horrible killings that took place in Bali in terms of cultivating an atmosphere, organizing the means and logistics of the killings which were mainly done by military from Java. Robinson's analysis is also a verdict, because it cannot be denied that both Soeharto, actively supported by the USA, which was very well informed about what happened, local commanders, and leaders of PNI gangs deliberately organized the massacre of thousands of innocent people. By playing up the cultural peculiarities of Bali, and depicting the PKI as the embodiment of evil as a result of which victims 'volunteered' to be killed, the responsibility for this criminal act has been deliberately obscured and moved into the elusive realm of culture.

Despite my admiration for this book, I still have one question and two critical remarks. In November 1946 the Dutch wiped out the major revolutionary force in Bali and killed almost hundred guerrillas in one day. Is there any connection between these killings and the mass killings committed by Raymond Westerling in South Sulawesi, and the plans to establish the state of Eastern Indonesia (NIT)? Did, in other words, the Dutch want to get rid of revolutionaries around the capital of the NIT (Ujung Pandang) and the place where the NIT was officially proclaimed in December 1946 (Denpasar)?

Although Robinson states repeatedly that, besides political and economic factors, it is also important to observe the cultural specificities of Bali (p. 12, 264, 275, 307, 311), we are never told precisely what these cultural factors actually were, nor how they played a role in conceptualizing politics and conflicts in the Balinese setting. Following on from this point, the second remark is that I miss an additional local perspective on political developments in Bali, especially when it concerns the massacre of 1965-1966. In this respect I also miss a more precise description of the role of the PNI gangs, the so-called Tameng Marhaenis. They are only mentioned in passing, but seemed to have been a vital element in the logistics of the killings.

My final conclusion is, however, that Robinson has written an outstanding study which deserves a large audience, also because he has reminded us once more about the bloody origins of the New Order regime.

---

Th. Stevens, *Vrijmetselarij en samenleving in Nederlands-Indië en Indonesië 1764-1962*. Hilversum: Verloren, 1994, 400 pp. ISBN 90.6550.391.9 (hardback), 90.6550.378.1 (paperback). Price f 65.- (pb).

HERMAN A.O. DE TOLLENAERE

This is the first extensive book in Dutch by a historian on Freemasonry in Indonesia. An earlier, shorter, English-language work on this subject is Paul W. Van der Veur, *Freemasonry in Indonesia from Radermacher to Soekanto, 1762-1961* (Ohio University, Center for International Studies, 1976). Th. Stevens who works at the University of Amsterdam did a great deal of research in such promising sources as the archives of Dutch Masonry in The Hague.

He divides the book into four parts, the first being the period 1764-1870. Then he moves on to the 'transitional' period, 1870-1890. This is followed by the 'heyday', 1890-1930. Last, he examines the 'struggle to survive' which began in 1930 and continued until 1961. In 1961, the Indonesian government banned the Masonic Order. Most members, being Dutch, had already left for to The Netherlands. Dr Stevens starts each part with a general overview of society and politics in Indonesia in the successive periods. He bases these chapters on existing literature; unlike his use of the sources which makes the other chapters so interesting.

The author sometimes makes mistakes on matters not directly connected to his subject. On p. 152, when discussing the first Indonesian youth congress of 1926 in Jakarta, he states that this congress was a 'completely different tendency within the national movement' to the Dutch-Indonesian League of Raden Mas Soeripto. However, this first congress, led by M. Tabrani, was not as radical as later youth congresses, not led by Tabrani. Tabrani and Soeripto were co-founders of the political party Partai Rakjat Indonesia. Its type of nationalism included co-operation with the colonial authority. The author has included an index of persons but an index of keywords would also have been helpful in a book of this size. Noting details like this, I in no way mean to disparage the merits of the book.

Freemasonry first arose in eighteenth century England. It became an interesting factor in the history of various countries, including countries under colonial rule. For instance, Abner Cohen wrote on its impact in Sierra Leone. In his Introduction Stevens briefly mentions Masonry in India. I may add that Motilal Nehru, a prominent politician and the father of independent India's first prime minister, was a member.

The claim in Freemasonry that its direct historical origins were organizations of genuine building, 'operative' masons in medieval Europe, is doubtful. Sometimes, Masons claimed even more ancient origins for their movement: referring to the Egyptian Pharaohs or even earlier. Other, more esoterically religious, movements, like the Theosophical Society and

Rosicrucian leagues, though arising later than Masonry and inspired by it, emphasized this type of claims even more. They, too, influenced colonial and post-colonial societies. In Cameroon today, Rosicrucianism is said to be prominent among high level army officers.

In Indonesia, Masons were among those who helped to set up the Theosophical Society in the 1900s. The latter eventually surpassed Masonry in terms of membership in the East Indies colony, especially among Indonesians.

Political writings by Indonesians sometimes mentioned Masonry. Raden Mas Soetatmo Soerikoesoemo's Committee for Javanese Nationalism claimed it had four inspirations: the philosophers Hegel and Bolland; Masonry; and theosophy. Despite such an assertion, Soetatmo, an active theosophist, never joined Masonry. In this, he is an example of the limited impact of Masonry even on most of those Indonesians among whom it might have found favour.

Theosophists organized their own masonry, Co-Masonry, which, in contrast to 'masculine' Masonry, also admitted women members. It soon had at least six branches in Java, and one in Medan in Sumatra. Among their members was the prominent theosophist Mrs Cornelia Rensina van Mook-Bouwman. She was an author of poetry on the reincarnation doctrine, and the mother of the future Mason and Lieutenant Governor-General, H.J. van Mook.

How useful is Stevens' book to other historians? I personally can say that it was useful while I was working on my PhD thesis on theosophy; even though it is only about masculine Masonry and barely mentions Co-Masonry and other links to the Theosophical Society.

Stevens deals extensively with the links of Masons to education, for example in the setting up of nursery schools which welcomed mainly Indo-European pupils. One central question in his vision is whether Masons have contributed to 'the improvement of society'.

To answer this question, one should consider the doctrine of the brotherhood of humanity, subscribed to by both Masons and theosophists. Theosophical writings modify this doctrine, by saying that there are elder and younger brothers; so, brotherhood implies inequality. Reading Stevens, one does not find any such limitations on the theory among the Masons. Yet, in practice, membership did not include the low-income earning majority of the people. The nineteenth-century author Multatuli wrote a famous story about an Asian stone-mason. The parlance of the 'symbolic' Masons would call him an 'operative' mason, at, in practice often, a lower level than their own.

Even though an organization is mainly composed of elite members, still a historian may find in their writings critical notes of wider social significance.

On p. 256, Stevens quotes from the Indies Masons' Review in 1930. It provides a glimpse of colonial entrepreneurial spirit which the historian will

not find in English-language propaganda booklets of the Netherlands Indies government of that time:

'Enchanted a sturdy 22-year old Dutch boy, imported but a short time ago, comes to tell me about his maiden experiences. A native dared to walk on a company road while still wearing his patent leather shoes. He wanted to pass the manager and two young white-collar employees, including my source. This really put the cat among the pigeons. The native got a brutal flogging, his shoes were roughly pulled off, and thrown at the fleeing brown brother. My young friend took part in this beating as his boss watched with complacency, and really enjoyed this work of civilization immensely. We have told him what we thought. However, the company adat had already taken root. The "shoes" are the culprit, the brown brother will have to pass his betters barefoot.'

Details like this make Stevens' book worthwhile.

---

Stuart Robson (ed.), *Deśawarnana (Nāgarakṛtāgama)* by Mpu Prapañca. Leiden: KITLV Press, 1995, viii + 158 pp. [Verhandelingen 169]. ISBN 90.6718.094.7. Price f40.-.

DONALD E. WEATHERBEE

The Old Javanese manuscript *Deśawarnana* ('Depiction of the Districts') by the Buddhist royal cleric Prapañca is better known to scholars as the *Nāgarakṛtāgama*, that title occurring outside the text in its first colophon. Composed in poetic *kakawin* form, the text's signal importance has not been its literary merit but its value as a primary source document for the history, politics, religion, and culture of mid-fourteenth-century Java. Dated AD 1365, the poem's subject matter is an account of the dynasty, court, and society of the Majapahit kingdom at its zenith under King Rājasa-nagara (AD 1350-1389). Written from what often appears to be Prapañca's personal knowledge and experiences, it contains a wealth of cultural and sociological detail. Prapañca himself called the poem *Deśawarnana*, which accords with the poem's narratives of royal progresses through the countryside and listings of royal and religious domains.

The *Deśawarnana* has been mined for information by four generations of scholars utilizing text editions and studies based on the single known manuscript recovered in 1894 from the palace of the Balinese ruler of Cakranagara on Lombok. Until 1960, the Old Javanese text had been translated only into Dutch (1917-18) and Indonesian (1953), limiting its utility for the international scholarly community. In 1960, in the course of his five volume study of *Java in the Fourteenth Century*, Dr Th. Pigeaud presented for the first time an English translation of the text. Independent of any evaluation of the lasting value of Pigeaud's total study, the con-

sensus has been that the English translation imperfectly conveyed the sense and meaning of Prapañca's original text. In part this was because of his decision to give a literal word-for-word rendition of the Javanese rather than an idiomatic and syntactically correct English translation.

Stuart Robson has now given us a proper English translation of the *Deśawarnana*. One need only compare at random passages from Pigeaud's English version and Robson's text to be convinced of the stylistic superiority of the latter. For example canto 71, stanza 1, verse 4:

[Pigeaud] 'Minding the state of existence (on earth), that it is inconstant, *punya* (good works) only was [what was] had at heart every day.'

[Robson] 'Mindful of the transient nature of existence, it was only good works to which he devoted himself daily.'

Or, canto 27, stanza 1, verse 4:

[Pigeaud] 'Wiped out are the stains, was the reflection of those who looked on, appearing intensely marveling.'

[Robson] 'And those who saw it imagined that their impurities would be wiped away and appeared to be utterly amazed.'

Robson had at his disposal a working text edition utilizing new manuscripts of the *Deśawarnana* discovered in Bali in 1979, providing some better readings than were previously available with only the one extant text. The most important historically of the new readings is the inclusion of the previously missing second verse of canto 68:1 dating Airlangga's division of the kingdom into Janggala and Pañjalu as AD 1052. In correcting Pigeaud's translation of 15:1, dealing with the mainland Southeast Asian relations of Majapahit, Robson enhances Prapañca's verisimilitude by identifying the countries named as friends or allies rather than dependencies.

Robson's goal was to provide a philologically sound English translation of the *kakawin* as a literary work. He is well-equipped for this task, having contributed to the *Śiwarātrikalpa* and *Kuñjarakarna kakawin* editions and English translations as well as collaborating with Professor P.J. Zoetmulder on the *Old Javanese-English Dictionary*. The translation is preceded by a brief introduction sketching the historical framework and is followed by a commentary that modestly confines itself to textual matters, eschewing opportunities to broaden the discussion beyond the philological bounds. For that, one still must refer to the existing literature, especially Pigeaud's extensive commentary. One can hope that this translation is a precursor to a new critical edition and commentary taking into account the archaeological and epigraphic data collected or reinterpreted since 1960, including the results of the recent systematic excavations at Trowulan, the site of Majapahit's urban centre.

---

Jennifer Lindsay, R.M. Soetanto and Alan Feinstein, *Kraton Yogyakarta*. Diterjemahkan oleh R.M. Soetanto dan T.E. Behrend. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia, 1994, xvi + 330 pp. [Seri Katalog Induk Naskah-Naskah Nusantara 2]. ISBN 979.461178.6.

E.P. WIERINGA

The present catalogue contains descriptions of two different collections of manuscripts which are housed in the Kraton Yogyakarta, namely the Krida Mardawa (circa 250 mss) and the Widya Budaya (circa. 450 mss). The manuscripts in the Krida Mardawa library deal exclusively with dance, music, and *wayang*. The majority are texts of *wayang wong* performances (*serat kandha* and *serat pocapan*) from the 1920s and 1930s. The manuscripts in the Widya Budaya library are of a more historical nature, containing a fair number of *babad*, *sarasilah*, and letters.

This catalogue is a revised edition in Indonesian of the unpublished *A preliminary descriptive catalogue of the manuscripts of the Kraton Yogyakarta*, by the same authors (Yogyakarta: Kanwil Depdikbud Prop. DIY, 1987). One of the new additions which should interest historians particularly is the entry of more than a hundred codices with letters (W.124-W.222a), which were not included in any of the previous catalogues of the Kraton Yogyakarta collections. The description of the Krida Mardawa collection (K.1-K.254; pp. 1-80) was the work of Lindsay, whereas the description of the Widya Budaya collection (W.1-W.378; pp. 81-228) was done by Soetanto and Feinstein. Besides descriptions, the catalogue is enriched by four appendices (pp. 229-30: list of abbreviations; pp. 231-2: list of Javanese kings; pp. 233-59: list of the microfilms; pp. 261-79: list of signatures), a bibliography (pp. 281-92), a title index (pp. 293-311) and, finally, a general index (pp. 313-30).

The introduction draws attention to the remarkable fact that the manuscripts in the Kraton of Yogyakarta are not very old. According to the cataloguers (pp. xi-xii) this is blamed on the looting of the Kraton libraries and archives by the British in June 1812. As war booty Yogyakarta Kraton manuscripts mainly found their way to libraries in England. Although this is undoubtedly an important reason for the loss of old manuscripts, I think there are at least two other, more general, reasons which account for this because the collections in Surakarta likewise do not contain many old manuscripts. Firstly, as a rule the composition of a new, rewritten version of a text normally led to the eclipse of an earlier (older) version. Palaces made no serious effort to preserve older texts which were considered superfluous (Behrend 1987:360-2). Secondly, and this is perhaps a more touchy subject to discuss, in former days older manuscripts were not always given careful attention. Nowadays the literary heritage may be praised by Javanese as *adiluhung* ('of supreme quality'), as is also

done by Sri Sultan Hamengku Buwono X in the Foreword (pp. vii-ix), although this overlooks the fact that before World War II in Solo, for example, it was not uncommon to burn heaps of old Kraton manuscripts because nobody was interested in this dusty 'rubbish' (see Soeripto 1929:115 note 1). Winter (1902:120) claims the disregard for original texts was due to the 'echt-Javaansche onverschilligheid voor authenticiteit van documenten'.

It is well known that dates in manuscripts generally tend to be rather difficult and frequently they are problematic. It seems that not all Javanese dates in the catalogue have been correctly converted to the Gregorian calendar, for example 3 Rejeb 1801 is not 13 September 1872, but 6 September 1872 (K.2); 29 Jumadilawal 1855 is not 26 December 1924, but 28 November 1924 (K.32); 5 Ruwah 1765 is not 13 December 1837, but 4 November 1837 (K.124); 14 Sapar 1877 is not 16 September 1946, but 18 January 1946 (K. 126); 15 Rejeb 1789 is not 17 January 1861, but 27 January 1861 (W.40), and 30 Sura 1828 is not 28 June 1898, but 20 June 1898 (W.54).

In the disquisition on Dutch colonial personalities I found some minor errors. 'P. van Goldstein (Minister van Koloniën)' (W.218c) should be 'W. (Baron) van Goltstein' and 'John Frederick Walraven van Ness' (W.219) should be 'Johan Frederik Walraven van Nes'. W. Rooseboom succeeded Van der Wijck (not 'Van der Wijk') in 1899 (and not in 1898) as Governor-General (W.95a). The 'Tuwan Yonghir Mister Wigres' (W.243), who could not be identified (and who is, by the way, omitted in the Indeks Umum), is Jonkheer Meester (Hendrik Ludolf) Wichers (1800-1853).

The book 'Isah (?)', which is mentioned in W.307 and which could not be identified, is most probably the *Ilah*, the Javanese title of the *Idah fi'l-Fikh* ('Elucidation of the Fikh'). An incomplete copy of this text was one of the manuscripts which were brought to the Netherlands from Indonesia at the end of the sixteenth century. For an identification of the *Ilah* as well as other Javanese titles of the Arabic books mentioned in W.307, see Soebardi 1971:335 or Soebardi 1975:163.

Fortunately running contrary to the usual tradition of Indonesian publishers, the book is well-produced and presented in an attractive cover. One minor flaw is on p. 113 where the capital 'E' in the titles of W.80-81a was not printed (so one finds, e.g., P RANG S P HI instead of PERANG SEPEHI). The authors deserve the gratitude of the student of Javanese literature for they have provided him or her with a useful tool to find their way in the manuscript collections of the Kraton Yogyakarta.

#### References

- Behrend, T.E., 1987, *The Serat Jatiswara; Structure and change in a Javanese poem 1600-1930*. [Ph.D. thesis Australian National University.]  
 Soebardi, 1971, 'Santri-religious elements as reflected in the book of Tjentiní', *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 127:331-349.  
 —, 1975, *The book of Cabolèk*. The Hague: Nijhoff.



Soeripto, 1929, *Ontwikkelingsgang der Vorstenlandsche wetboeken*. Leiden: IJdo.  
 Winter, J.W., 1902, 'Beknopte beschrijving van het hof Soerakarta in 1824 (met voorwoord en eenige noten van G.P. Rouffaer)', *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 54:15-172.

---

Wouter Smit, *De islam binnen de horizon; Een missiologische studie over de benadering van de islam door vier Nederlandse zendingscorporaties (1797-1951)*. Zoetermeer: Boekencentrum, 1995, xix + 312 pp. [MISSION 11]. ISBN 90.239.1481.3. Prijs: f 49,90.

E.P. WIERINGA

Wouter Smit, hervormd predikant en lid van de Raad voor de Zending van de Nederlandse Hervormde Kerk, promoveerde in 1995 aan de Rijksuniversiteit Utrecht op deze studie. De auteur noemt zijn werk een zendingshistorisch onderzoek naar de 'benadering' ('daarachter ligt het Engelse woord approach, dat zowel theoretisch als praktisch gebruikt wordt', p. 2) van de islam door vier Nederlandse zendingscorporaties, het Nederlandsch Zendelinggenootschap (NZG), het Java-Comité (JC), de Nederlandsche Zendingsvereeniging (NZV) en de Utrechtsche Zendingsvereeniging (UZV). De studie bestrijkt een periode van ruim 150 jaar, van 1797 tot 1951. In 1797 werd het NZG opgericht en in 1951 werd de verantwoordelijkheid voor het werk van de inmiddels gefuseerde zendingsgenootschappen overgenomen door de Generale Synode van de Nederlandse Hervormde Kerk, 'daarin bijgestaan door de Raad voor de Zending (RvdZ) als orgaan van bijstand' (p. 1).

De hoofdstukken 1 en 2 zijn inleidend, terwijl hoofdstuk 3 over het NZG in de periode 1797-1848 laat zien dat er in de eerste helft van de negentiende eeuw nog maar weinig aandacht bestond voor de islam in zendingskringen. Uit onvrede met de invloed van de liberale theologie (Groninger School en Moderne Richting) in het NZG ontstonden achtereenvolgens het JC (1854), de NZV (1858) en de UZV (1859) die geworteld waren in het Réveil. In hoofdstuk 4 beschrijft de auteur per zendingsvereniging de bestudering van de islam, de benadering van de islam door het bestuur en door de zendelingen. De Samenwerkende Zendingscorporaties waarin de vier zendingsverenigingen in 1905 waren opgegaan, vormt het onderwerp van hoofdstuk 5. De studie wordt afgesloten met een 'Slotbeschouwing' (hoofdstuk 6).

Smit heeft gekozen voor descriptieve geschiedschrijving, maar aan analyse van het bijeengebrachte feitenmateriaal komt hij vaak niet toe. De 'evaluaties' aan het eind van ieder hoofdstuk zijn niet meer dan samenvattingen. Om slechts één voorbeeld te geven: op verschillende plaatsen in het boek staat te lezen dat vanaf 1888 het gouvernement de zending wilde

gebruiken om de opmars van de islam onder 'heidenen' te stuiten (pp. 85, 95, 155, 185). Waarom juist toen? Had dit misschien te maken met de moeilijke Atjeh-oorlog? Een Kamerlid meende in 1888 dat Bataks na bekering tot het christendom bondgenoten konden zijn in de strijd tegen het moslimse Atjeh (p. 85). De schrijver gaat hierop echter niet in.

Snouck Hurgronje heeft volgens Smit jarenlang 'belangeloos' aan de opleiding van zendelingen meegewerkt 'vanuit zijn idee van naastenliefde'. Smit (p. 212) schrijft: 'Van Koningsveld verklaart dit uit de vrijzinnig-protestantse levenshouding van Snouck. Zelf voegen wij daaraan toe dat Snouck de zending met haar zendelingen gezien heeft als een goed instrument in het streven naar een zedelijke opwaardering van het islamitisch leven in Indonesië.' Wat is echter 'belangeloos'? Op pp. 216-217 komt duidelijk naar voren dat Snouck de zending zag als één van de instrumenten voor zijn 'associatiepolitiek': 'die inspanning waardoor er voldoende eenheid van cultuur tussen de bewoners van de Lage Landen en Insulinde bestaat, zodat aan het verschil in godsdienstige belijdenis de politieke en sociale betekenis ontnomen is.'

Als zendingsmethode vond ik vooral de 'kolonisatie' interessant, die de vorming inhield van christen-desa's waar de inwoners in volmaakte afzondering van de (moslimse) buitenwereld leven. Is deze methode typisch voor de protestantse denkwereld of paste de missie ook kolonisatie toe? Ik dacht meteen aan de Kuyperiaanse slagzin 'soevereiniteit in eigen kring'.

Ondanks 'stimulerende correctie' van het Nederlands waarvoor de schrijver in het 'Woord vooraf' zijn dank uitspreekt (p. vii), wordt het taalgebruik ontsierd door uitdrukkingen als 'een stuk contextualisatie' (p. 4), 'dit stuk werk' (p. 125), en het neologisme gebruik van 'vanuit' met 'vanuit de context van waaruit' (p. 242) als dieptepunt. Lelijk is ook dat zaken 'op de agenda' staan of daarop worden geplaatst (maar liefst drie keer op p. 276) om van het woord 'evaluatie' maar te zwijgen. Stilistisch is het zwak om op p. 184 een citaat van vijf regels van p. 182 te doubleren en dan te schrijven: 'Wij herhalen onze conclusie dat'. De enkele tikfoutjes in het boek zijn niet al te storend, maar men moet letten op een verschrijving die tweemaal voorkomt: op p. 162, 4e regel van onderen, en op p. 171, onderste regel, leze men 'Verhoeven' in plaats van 'Voorhoeve'.

Smit heeft een systematisch en uitputtend overzicht gegeven van de islamvisie van vier Nederlandse zendingscorporaties in de periode 1797-1951 aan de hand van vooral gedrukte bronnen. Door de vele parafrases doorspekt met citaten lijkt het boek wel een bronnenpublicatie en is het een *Fundgrube* voor verder onderzoek.

---